

INTEGRATING SPIRITUALITY AND PSYCHOTHERAPY: A PASTORAL
COUNSELING PARADIGM FOR THE NAVY CHAPLAIN

A Professional Project
Presented to
the Faculty of the
School of Theology at Claremont

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Ministry

by
David K. Sanders
May 1993

© 1993

David K. Sanders

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

This professional project, completed by

David Kenneth Sanders,

*has been presented to and accepted by the Faculty
of the School of Theology at Claremont in partial
fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of*

DOCTOR OF MINISTRY

Faculty Committee

William M. Clements

Mary Elizabeth Moore

May 3, 1993

Date

all Moore

Dean

ABSTRACT

Integrating Spirituality and Psychotherapy: A Pastoral Counseling Paradigm for the Navy Chaplain

by

David K. Sanders

Pastoral counseling in Navy chaplaincy tends to be more reactive in problem-resolution than proactive in facilitating self-actualization and wholistic growth. Typically, theology and psychology are not blended symmetrically in a compatible working relationship that accomplishes problem-resolution, self-actualization, and wholistic growth. This project unites these two disciplines by integrating spirituality and psychotherapy to produce a paradigm that deals with problem-resolution while promoting self-actualization and wholistic growth.

Chapter 2 constructs a theology of pastoral care and counseling that is sensitive and applicable to the unique context of Navy chaplaincy. This particular theology integrates congruent aspects of Karl Barth's theology of "as God is, so God acts" with Friedrich Schleiermacher's experiential theology of "faith as feeling" and Juergen Moltmann's expectant "theology of hope." Such a theology is consistent with the nature and actions of God, human experience, and hope for wholistic growth.

The relational and spiritual dimensions of the self are addressed in Chapter 3 to provide a more wholistic description of selfhood. The Stone Center's "self-in-

relation" theory is used to assert the relational capacity of the self. Ana-Maria Rizzuto's psychoanalytic "God representations" are employed to illustrate the value of illusion in formulating images of God. And Carl Jung's concept of the "collective unconscious" is utilized to develop and to expound upon the premise that human beings are inherently spiritual.

In Chapter 4, spirituality, depicted through selected spiritual practices, is integrated with relevant psychological principles of three psychotherapies to produce a synergistic paradigm for pastoral counseling. Cognitive therapy, Rogerian client-centered therapy, and Jungian psychoanalysis are analyzed and principles are drawn from these theories to assist persons in moving toward self-actualization and wholistic growth.

Chapter 5 is the concluding chapter. It integrates the findings of Chapters 2, 3, and 4 and proposes a viable paradigm for Navy chaplains to incorporate spiritual and psychotherapeutic principles into pastoral counseling. The paradigm promotes wholistic growth by dealing with problem-resolution and by fostering self-actualization.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This professional project was made possible by the encouragement and support of so many people. I hesitate to mention specific people because in doing so I will certainly and unintentionally fail to name people who directly or indirectly assisted me in giving birth to this endeavor. However, I feel compelled to name those individuals who encouraged me to think big thoughts and be willing to take the risk of putting those thoughts and ideas in writing. My sincerest and deepest thanks are extended to the United States Navy Chaplain Corps for affording me the opportunity to resume my education in the area of pastoral counseling; Rev. Stephen Meadors, a fellow student, colleague, and superb friend who encouraged me and provided reality testing along the way during our morning jogs; Dr. Lynn Mallery, a former undergraduate professor who taught me the value of pastoral care and counseling; Captain Nigel Parkhurst, USN, who not only brought me back safely from Operation Desert Storm but afforded me the opportunity to experience and share the blessings of the Lord in the midst of combat; Rev. Frank Masserano, Director of the International Ministerial Fellowship and my endorsing agent for military chaplaincy who continues to support me as I seek new ways to minister more effectively; and the officers and crew of the USS DENVER, who served with me during Operation Desert Storm and inspired me to reach my potential in the midst of adversity.

Special thanks to Dr. William Clements, Edna and Lowell Craig Professor of Pastoral Care and Counseling at the School of Theology at Claremont and my professional project committee chairman who inspired me and assisted me in the construction of this project; Dr. Mary Elizabeth Mullino Moore, Professor of Theology and Christian Education at the School of Theology at Claremont, Professor of Religion at Claremont Graduate School and my professional project committee advisor who challenged, assisted, and supported me in the production of this project; Elaine Walker, Thesis Secretary, for her professional guidance and support in the overall format of this project; and Dr. Carolyn Wolf Spanier, for her enthusiastic encouragement and support during and after the Doctor of Ministry Colloquium.

Last but certainly not least, my continued love and appreciation to my wife, Michelle, and son, Sean, for their understanding, patience, support, encouragement, love, and sense of humor. Without their ongoing commitment and sacrifices this professional project would not have been possible.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Chapter	
1. Introduction	1
Importance of the Problem	1
Thesis	3
Description of Major Terms	3
Work Previously Done in the Field	7
Scope and Limitations of the Project	9
Procedure for Integration	10
2. Toward an Expectant Theology of Pastoral Care and Counseling in Navy Chaplaincy	11
Developing an Appropriate Ecclesiology	15
Narrative Theology	21
Sacramental Theology	23
Dealing with Sin	26
Mission	28
Summary	33
3. The Spiritual Dimension of Selfhood: Toward a More Wholistic Understanding	35
Self-in-Relation Theory: A Spiritual Twist	39
Object Relations Theory: The God Representation	44
The God Archetype in the Collective Unconscious	52
Conclusion	57

4.	Utilizing Spirituality in Pastoral Counseling: An Integration of Spirituality and Psychotherapy	59
	The Relevancy of Spirituality in Psychotherapy	63
	A Symmetrization of Spirituality and Cognitive Therapy	67
	An Integration of Spirituality in Client- centered Therapy	73
	Insights of Spirituality from Jungian Psychoanalysis	77
	A Synergistic Paradigm for Pastoral Counseling	79
5.	A Pastoral Counseling Paradigm for the Navy Chaplain	84
	Integrating Interfaith Spiritual Practices into a Synergistic Paradigm	84
	Indigenous Religious Traditions	85
	Hinduism	87
	Buddhism	89
	Confucianism and Taoism	91
	Judaism	93
	Islam	95
	Implementation of Principles	97
	Conclusion	103
	Bibliography	105

DEDICATED TO MY WIFE,
MICHELLE LYNETTE SANDERS.
BECAUSE OF HER LOVE, I AM
LOVED AND ENABLED TO GIVE LOVE.

CHAPTER 1

Introduction

The crucial problem in pastoral counseling, specifically in the Navy, is the fact that most pastoral counseling focuses primarily on problem-resolution. This is generally accomplished through the functions of guiding and sustaining. Pastoral counseling within the structured environment of the Navy would be better served if it concentrated on equipping the client with coping skills that seek problem-resolution while promoting the process of self-actualization and transcendence through healing, reconciliation, and wholistic growth.

Importance of the Problem

Pastoral counseling tends to be somewhat fragmented and lopsided, especially in the Navy. Generally, pastoral counseling focuses more on problem-resolution than the process of self-actualization and transcendence and often utilizes the disciplines of theology and counseling methodologies unproportionately. Instead of blending the two disciplines together symmetrically, they are often placed in juxtaposition and pieced together, producing a pastoral counseling format that is either too theist or too secular. These theist or secular formats concentrate almost exclusively on problem-resolution, or the process of self-actualization and transcendence, but rarely incorporate these aspects into one concerted methodology.

Since I believe people have wholistic needs, it is imperative that pastoral counseling address and meet these needs by integrating theology and counseling methodologies to develop a pastoral counseling paradigm that seeks problem-resolution while promoting the process of self-actualization and transcendence. If pastoral counseling is to remain effective and relevant, especially in the Navy, it must stay abreast with harmonious theories and practices inherent in theology and counseling methodologies by distilling and integrating these theories and practices into a viable pastoral counseling paradigm.

A pastoral counseling paradigm which seeks to integrate pertinent spirituality and compatible psychotherapy must be both feasible and flexible. Such a pastoral counseling paradigm must meet the wholistic needs of the individual and do so in a way that is receptive to the client's religious preference (or lack of preference), gender, culture, or to the unique plural characteristics and structural demands of the Navy. Such a pastoral counseling paradigm must provide the client with viable options that would assist in equipping the individual with coping skills and stress management techniques for problem-resolution while promoting the process of self-actualization and transcendence. The challenge is to facilitate this without minimizing or undermining the hierarchal and authority-based structure of the Navy; the goal is to continue providing quality pastoral

care and counseling to the individual.

Thesis

This project seeks to integrate spirituality, expressed through selected interfaith spiritual practices, with compatible psychotherapeutic methods to develop a pastoral counseling paradigm that is sensitive to the unique plural characteristics and demands of the Navy. This particular pastoral counseling paradigm focuses on two goals. First, the paradigm concentrates on equipping the client with coping skills and stress management techniques which resolve problems via guiding and sustaining. Secondly, the paradigm promotes the process of self-actualization and transcendence through healing, reconciliation, and wholistic growth.

Description of Major Terms

Spiritual refers to that innate dimension of an individual that is open and responsive to God, a supreme being or power which is both immanent and transcendent. Spiritual differs from religious or religion in the sense that it is not necessarily associated with an established faith group (religion).

Spirituality centers on a theology of experience that focuses on a capacity for self-transcendence where a person experiences ultimate reality through faith in the context of a lived reality.¹ Ultimate reality is that realm of

¹ This description is a summary and paraphrase of Bradley C. Hanson, "Spirituality as Spiritual Theology," in Modern Christian Spirituality: Methodological and Historical Essays,

existence beyond one's immediate perception which is both real and distant. Occasionally ultimate reality interfaces with daily human existence, or lived reality, through mystical experiences of faith that transcend the known. Spirituality is both a theological discipline and an experience that reflects upon theology and the meaning of human existence in light of one's being and one's relationship to a supreme being or power.

Psychotherapy is the scientific method of applying psychological theories in a controlled counseling environment to reduce and remove mental and physical dysfunctions. Psychotherapy endeavors to apply the science of psychology through the relationship and interaction of the counselor with the counselee in a protected setting to effect the cure of mental and physical dysfunctions.

Pastoral counseling is "a specialized type of pastoral care offered in response to individuals, couples, or families who are experiencing and able to articulate the pain in their lives and willing to seek pastoral help in order to deal with it."² Specifically within the context of Navy chaplaincy, a pastoral counselor is an appointed religious leader of an identified faith group who provides one-to-one or small group support and counsel to people

ed. B.C. Hanson (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1990), 45.

² John Patton, "Pastoral Counseling," in Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling, ed. Rodney J. Hunter (Nashville: Abingdon, 1990), 849-54.

experiencing emotional and physical dysfunctions, inhibiting or impairing their ability to function in their personal or societal sphere. Most often, pastoral counseling is facilitated by a licensed or ordained minister of a Christian denomination. However, especially within Navy chaplaincy, the phrase itself cannot be relegated to Christian denominations alone since there are other faith groups that employ their religious leaders to function essentially in the same capacity (i.e., Judaism, Islam, Buddhism, Hinduism, etc.).

Navy chaplaincy comprises a specialized ministry to military personnel and their families serving in the sea services of the United States: Navy, Marine Corps, Coast Guard, and two Merchant Marine billets. Navy chaplains are ordained clergy and authorized religious representatives of a recognized faith group who are endorsed by that body to represent their particular faith group and assist all service members in meeting their religious and personal needs. Currently, the United States Navy Chaplain Corps consists of Christian and Jewish chaplains whose primary functions include: providing for the free exercise of religion for all people; facilitating divine worship services from the perspective of one's own faith group; arranging for the services of other faith groups; administering the sacraments and rites of one's own faith group; and conducting pastoral counseling. Other functions

are performed by Navy chaplains which are directly or indirectly associated with ministry, such as the administration of the Command Religious Program (functions of ministry at a particular command, naval station or marine base) and the execution of collateral duties assigned by the commanding officer. The Navy chaplain is both an ordained clergy person and a naval officer, subject to the rules and regulations of his or her faith group and the United States military branch to which that clergy person is assigned.

Problem-resolution is the identification and removal of issues identified as problems by the client, problems that impair one's ability to function emotionally or physically. Problem-resolution is the elimination of the identified problem(s), which implies resumption of personally and socially acceptable behavior.

Self-actualization is the process of development of the individual toward maximum human potential. Self-actualization stresses the growth of the human organism to achieve its highest potential and realize its greatest worth in essence and function.³

Transcendence describes the experience of exceeding the ordinary limitations imposed by human spatial experience. In mystical thought, transcendence refers to a spiritual

³ Abraham Maslow employed this term to illustrate the "peak experience" of human existence. Self-actualization is only achieved when a hierarchy of human needs are first met. See Abraham Maslow, Motivation and Personality (New York: Harper & Bros., 1954), 214-15.

experience that goes beyond human comprehension and is spiritually apprehended through spiritual disciplines.

Wholistic means individual entities are viewed in relation to the sum total of the whole and are not viewed as separate entities (i.e., human beings are wholistic individuals with four dimensions: physical, mental, spiritual, and social). When wholistic is applied to another word, it modifies that word to mean the physical, mental, spiritual, and social dimensions of the whole.

Work Previously Done in the Field

The impetus behind this project comes from an enlightened awareness of the need to facilitate wholistic pastoral counseling. Since pastoral counseling implies some semblance of cohabitation between the disciplines of spirituality and psychotherapy, I desire to unite these two disciplines in a pastoral counseling paradigm. This is accomplished by accentuating the most compatible elements of the two disciplines and uniting them in a model that compliments their strengths and applicability and affords them an opportunity to flourish instead of merely coexisting.

Spirituality, as a discipline of theology and as an expression of praxis, provides the theological dimension to the paradigm. Though not explicit, the idea for applying spirituality to psychotherapy has been implied in most of the literature with the exception of the article by Rosen,

which was explicit from the perspective of cognitive therapy. The integration of spirituality and psychotherapy is paramount to my premise that spirituality and psychotherapy are both applicable and therapeutic when employed in pastoral counseling. Certain styles of existing psychotherapies are particularly congruent with the integration of spirituality and psychotherapy via pastoral counseling. Three such styles of psychotherapy are cognitive therapy, Rogerian client-centered therapy, and Jungian psychoanalysis.

This project applies compatible elements of the two disciplines of spirituality and psychotherapy to produce an effective pastoral counseling paradigm that seeks problem-resolution while promoting the process of self-actualization in the structured environment of the Navy. Though this project specifically focuses upon a pastoral counseling paradigm for the Navy chaplain, it is applicable for pastoral counseling in general. The primary contribution of this project is its interfaith dimension of applying spiritual practices from various religions that are compatible with other religious traditions and with psychotherapeutic methods; the goal is to construct a viable pastoral counseling paradigm for pastoral counselors, and specifically for Navy chaplains, by addressing the varied needs of religious or secular clients.

Scope and Limitations of the Project

Since I am a Christian, and since the majority of Navy chaplains are Christians as well, it only seems appropriate to develop a theology of pastoral care and counseling from a Christian perspective which is open and receptive to the validity and contributions of other religions. Since it is my assumption that human beings are essentially spiritual beings, I believe it is important to view the self as possessing relational and spiritual dimensions. I intend to concentrate on selected interfaith spiritual disciplines and on three psychotherapies which are compatible with the theology and praxis of various religions and the unique characteristics and demands of the Navy. Therefore, the scope of this project centers on identifying and integrating selected interfaith spiritual disciplines, such as Christian and Eastern practices, with compatible elements of three styles of psychotherapy--cognitive therapy, Rogerian client-centered therapy, and Jungian psychoanalysis. This will be specifically illustrated in the concluding chapter.

The limitations of such an undertaking are numerous, since the literature in the fields of spirituality, psychotherapy, and pastoral counseling is voluminous. With the pluralistic environment and demands of the Navy being so diversified, the pastoral counseling paradigm will strive to be applicable to many faith groups and to those individuals having no religious preference. The pastoral counseling

paradigm itself will be employed by only Christian and Jewish chaplains, since only these two religions are currently represented in Navy chaplaincy. This pastoral counseling paradigm is not intended to be prescriptive. The model will develop principles and practices that are applicable to problem-resolution, self-actualization, and transcendence but will not prescribe precise procedures for specific problems. The pastoral counselor will be afforded the freedom and creativity to extract these principles and practices and apply them to specific situations as deemed appropriate.

Procedure for Integration

The procedure for integrating the fields of spirituality and psychotherapy into pastoral counseling in the Navy concentrates on the descriptive and empirical models of methodology. Pertinent literature is reviewed and analyzed and conclusions are drawn and applied. The writer's previous experience in the field of pastoral counseling, both as a parish minister and as a Navy chaplain (totalling approximately 15 years), is employed to evaluate the viability of integrating these two disciplines into a pastoral counseling paradigm for the Navy chaplain.

CHAPTER 2

Toward an Expectant Theology of Pastoral Care
and Counseling in Navy Chaplaincy

When belief in God leads to assurance that no one is beyond redemption, the pastor may have hope where other counselors despair. But theology has little to say about the goals and methods of this kind of counseling except that they too are legitimate if they ease suffering and restore community.

John B. Cobb, Jr.,
Theology and Pastoral Care

In my opinion, theology is a human endeavor par excellence. From a human perspective, theology seeks to study and to analyze God's essential nature, actions, and influence in a systematic and religious manner. In the Christian community theology identifies God as the supreme being who originates life and who is therefore worthy of worship. Since theology attempts to grasp and articulate the divine mysteries of God through human perception and experience, certain presuppositions, prejudices, and limitations are inherent.

A dominant presupposition is that human logic is the formidable means to comprehend and to evaluate the meaning of the divine mysteries of God, regardless of whether these divine mysteries are experienced primarily cognitively or affectively. This cognitive approach is predicated on the assumption that God is comprehensible and able to be evaluated logically in light of special revelation and empirical data.

My assumption is that total objectivity in theological reflection and subsequent theological construction is essentially an illusion. Theology originates from human theological reflection and is significantly influenced by one's subjective personal experiences in life and by one's subjective encounter with the "theos" of the "ology" of the revelatory data. The illusion of objectivity is constantly being influenced by the reality of subjectivity in theological reflection. This tension is healthy for theology because it provides a balanced perspective in conceptualizing God as a supreme being who is vested with godly qualities but also a supreme being who is very much related to humanity and concerned about earthly issues.

I prefer not to limit theology to the cognitive element alone. In fact, I believe the cognitive aspect needs to be informed, influenced, and evaluated in light of the affective experiences manifested in ministry so that a more wholistic understanding of the nature and actions of God can become more feasible and applicable to the human situation. This means that human experience and revelation need to unite, inform, and cooperate with one another to produce a more expectant (hopeful) theology that has ministerial applicability in the ministry of pastoral care and counseling. More specifically, a hopeful theology that is true to natural and special revelation needs to be consistent with and applicable to the complexity of human

existence and be feasible in meeting the diverse needs of humanity.

Congruent aspects of theologies such as Friedrich Schleiermacher's theology of "faith as feeling,"¹ Karl Barth's theology of "as God is, so God acts,"² and Juergen Moltmann's "theology of hope"³ are appropriate and relevant in providing some basic guidance in constructing a meaningful theology. Aspects of theologies which begin "from below" and focus on religious faith as feeling, and aspects of theologies which originate "from above" through special revelation provide a more wholistic and expectant theological construct, particularly in Navy chaplaincy. The former is exemplified by Schleiermacher's focus on natural revelation, and the latter by Barth's emphasis on God's consistent nature and actions and Moltmann's theology of hope.

My belief, and the fundamental premise of this chapter, is that the ministry of pastoral care and counseling in Navy chaplaincy provides a more particular and specialized context for constructing a practical and expectant theology

¹ Bradley C. Hanson, introduction to Modern Christian Spirituality, 8.

² This particular phrase was utilized by Marjorie Suchocki in the course "Theology of Ministry," Fall 1991, School of Theology at Claremont. The phrase denotes Karl Barth's reciprocal concept of God's nature and action in Dogmatics in Outline (New York: Harper & Row, 1959).

³ Juergen Moltmann, Theology of Hope (New York: Harper & Row, 1967).

for ministry due to the inherent tension in Navy chaplaincy between the individual and the military system. This particular and practical theology unites theologies "from below" with theologies "from above" and is hope-filled and specifically oriented toward Navy chaplaincy. It is also relevant to all ministries dealing with pastoral care and counseling because it is sensitive to the human dilemma.

Don S. Browning is helpful here in employing the imagery of living "on scraps." He believes that we all "live on bits and pieces, yes, scraps of meaning" that assist us in our transition through life by providing us with pieces to hold on to until we move forward to obtain another piece of meaning to grasp and process.⁴ I believe my expectant theology provides these "scraps of meaning." It remains hopeful in the presence of manifold suffering and despair by being grounded in the religious community's experiences of faith and in the expectancy that incorporates the past activities of God with expectations of the reign of God in the midst of human existence.

Juergen Moltmann capitalizes on the concept of expectancy in his book, Theology of Hope. He posits hope as the motivating factor that enables the individual to rise above the present context of suffering and despair by focusing on the reality of God's previous triumphant

⁴ Don S. Browning, Religious Thought and the Modern Psychologies (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987), 1.

activity in raising Christ from the dead. This past event affords the Christian and the faith community an opportunity to place human suffering and despair in perspective by realizing God suffered with Christ in the agony of the cross. Likewise, God suffers with humanity in the agonizing situations of human existence and provides hope in these painful situations by being personally present in actual suffering and by being incarnationally present through the faith community, specifically in overcoming suffering and ultimately in triumphing over oppression and death. God, the sufferer, and the faith community are not fixated on pain because the reality of the resurrection of Christ is the impetus that God uses for drawing the sufferer forward in freedom, joy, and hope.⁵

This mutual suffering and expectancy have a distinctive communal foundation. God, the sufferer, and the faith community are all linked together through pain, freedom, joy, hope, and promise. They are all constantly moving forward from pain to hope because God is future oriented. Since theology is done in community and not in a vacuum, it is important, as well as appropriate, to view the role of ecclesiology in the development of this expectant theology of pastoral care and counseling in Navy chaplaincy.

Developing an Appropriate Ecclesiology

Ministry is to theology what eating is to food--the

⁵ Moltmann, 19-22.

application. The vehicle which drives ministry is the church. A suitable ecclesiology for the Navy chaplain requires an inclusive, or all-encompassing, ministry. Characteristically, the church has been analogous to a fortress where people periodically participate in search and rescue missions to save the lost. When the lost are saved they retreat to the shelter of the fortress to be nurtured and equipped to return such a favor to other lost individuals.⁶ Traditionally, the church has been in the world, but not of the world. More accurately, the church has not taken responsibility for the custodial care of the world because the church has viewed herself as being essentially a migrant worker in a foreign land, tasked with the responsibility of gleaning individuals for the kingdom. This archaic depiction of the church has fostered misunderstanding and resentment throughout the centuries and has seriously distorted the concept of the reign of God by relegating it exclusively to the Christian Church. The church has been portrayed as not only being exclusive but also insensitive to the preservation of the earth and her natural resources.

⁶ Though this particular imagery of the church is different from the imagery developed in a parable by Theodore Wedel depicting the church as a life saving station, the analogy is somewhat similar in that they both reveal the fact that the church is cut off from society except for occasional forays to seek and to save the lost. See Howard Clinebell, Jr., Basic Types of Pastoral Care and Counseling: Resources for the Ministry of Healing and Growth, rev. ed. (Nashville: Abingdon, 1984), 13-14.

A more relevant and theologically-based description of the church would be a mobile community of redeemed and gifted Christians dispersed throughout the world, seeking to live in relationship with God and to carry out God's will. This involves a reciprocal and cooperative relationship with the creative triune God, one another, and the world. Functionally, the church internalizes the gospel and translates it into good news through the mobilization of her members in promoting salvation, spiritual nurture, human growth, and social justice. In particular, this means accepting those of differing religious beliefs and respecting them and their religious beliefs while assisting them in meeting human need and eliminating human suffering; the purpose is not to manipulate them to convert to Christianity because of human tragedy. This also means encouraging persons to accept responsibility for the maintenance and preservation of the earth and her natural resources because these are viewed as gifts from God. The reign of God is not relegated solely to the ministry of the Christian Church. God is not an exclusive god. God is an inclusive god who ministers to the world through the church and often in spite of the church, as well as through other religions and historical developments and often in spite of them as well.

This inclusive depiction of the Christian Church and God corresponds with the essential nature of the creative

triune God and is an active expression of God's generating nature. It is here, in particular, that my expectant theology concurs with Karl Barth's theology--"as God is, so God acts."⁷ The essence of Karl Barth's theology is that God's nature is consistent with God's will. God's nature and will are expressed through corresponding actions in heaven and on earth. Since God exists in a trinitarian community (i.e., Father, Son, and Holy Spirit), so God's church exists in a trinitarian community (i.e., believer, corporate body, and world). Community implies relationship with someone or something. The Father, Son, and Holy Spirit exist and function in relationship with each other and with the world, as the believer, corporate body, and world exist in relationship with one another and with God. "The Christian congregation arises and exists neither by nature nor by historical human decision, but as a divine convocation [sic]."⁸ These two triune communities from above and below operate in reciprocity. They exist and function in relationship with the other and in support of the other.

The significance of this reciprocal relationship is actualized when the church realizes that her justification for existence and her empowerment for action in the world are derived from and interdependent with the triune God's creative and generative nature. The life of the church on

⁷ Barth, 52.

⁸ Barth, 142.

earth is to respond to God's will and cooperate with God's work. "A Church that recognises [sic] its commission will neither desire nor be able to petrify in any of its functions, to be the Church for its own sake."⁹ To do otherwise is contrary to the essence of her being and is a betrayal of her nature and function.

To assume that the church instinctively and automatically operates out of her creative and generative nature is, in my opinion, both illusionary and presumptuous. Friedrich Schleiermacher's emphasis on the "feeling of absolute dependence"¹⁰ depicts faith as feeling, broadly understood, in the religious experience of the Christian. His development of a theology which originates "from below" through a Christian community on earth is essential because it grounds theology in human experience. This intuitive approach to ultimate religious authority exalts love over law and seeks to bring about unity and peace by reconciling apparently conflicting values, such as ideal and real. God, for Schleiermacher, is grasped intuitively as feeling and experience. However, I feel Schleiermacher's theology can be complimented and augmented with a more explicit cognitive understanding of God and God's will, especially drawing from Barth's "as God is, so God acts"--a theology "from above."

⁹ Barth, 146.

¹⁰ Friedrich Schleiermacher, The Christian Faith, ed. H. R. Mackintosh (Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1928), 131.

Also of importance is Moltmann's theology of hope because it specifically addresses pastoral care and counseling issues, and tends to unite these two theologies through hope and promise by providing continual movement forward. Though these three theologies are uniquely different from one another, I have opted to employ significant theological themes from each of them and unite these elements in a coherent theology of expectancy.

I have chosen to unite these three theologies in an eclectic and synergistic manner. I have selected this method because I view the functions of experience, rationality, and natural and special revelation as being appropriate means to critique theology in light of historical developments. The locus of evaluation and authority for determining the validity of a theology, especially an expectant theology, rests with the believer in community with other Christians within a particular existential and cultural situation.¹¹ However, the religious community needs to exercise this authority with consideration and analysis of all available data so as to make an informed and educated judgment. This involves biblical scholarship and seeks to extract the intended principles without getting locked into specific time,

¹¹ David Augsburger is beneficial here in extracting intrinsic principles and applying them across cultures. See Augsburger, Pastoral Counseling Across Cultures (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1986).

location, and cultural issues that are irrelevant or not germane to the present life story and experience of the individual or community. In essence, this particular theological method relies heavily upon the cognitive process of critical scholarship, contextual particularity, and the application of biblical principles to concrete life experiences. Yet it also relies significantly upon the affective experiences of religious experience and spirituality.

Narrative Theology

An expectant theology is best understood as reverent narrative theology, manifested primarily in the biblical account of salvation history from Genesis to Revelation and fleshed-out in the lives of biblical characters.¹² Nevertheless, it is not limited to the biblical account alone, because the creator God is an inclusively parental God who has been operative in the lives of everyone throughout history. God has manifested Himself/Herself in different religions and through historical interactions and developments throughout human history.

Since Christ is the visible manifestation of the inclusive triune God and the effectual agent through whom salvation was and is accomplished, it seems only natural to

¹² C. S. Song's Asian narrative theology is especially helpful in constructing a people-oriented theology that is relevant to Asian cultural and ethnic orientation. See Song, Tell Us Our Names: Story Theology from an Asian Perspective (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1984).

reflect upon the story of His life and ministry as an appropriate example for inclusive ministry. Such a theology is predominately Christocentric and presence-oriented, yet it is not meant to imply that Christ is the only appropriate example for ministry. Rather, this infers that God's transcendence seeks immanence through the Christ. God desires to become known, to participate in human experience through relationship, and to have a ministry of presence in the world by actively engaging in the salvific process individually and corporately.

God's immanence is expressed through relationship and is dramatically realized in the birth of God the Son as the fulfillment of the messianic promise of Immanuel (Luke 1:23 and Isa. 7:14). God took the initiative in effecting a relationship with humanity because God is people-oriented and desirous of maintaining a conscious presence in the world. God is not only "God with us, . . . but for us" (Rom. 8:31). God is not only with us but consistently seeks our best interest and goodwill. These two elements of "being with us" and "for us" are the two most prominent features that link an expectant theology with ministry in the sea services.

Again, employing the Barthian notion, "as God is, so God acts," provides the basic impetus for ministry in Navy chaplaincy. Building upon the previously mentioned concepts of God being with us and for us, Navy chaplaincy strives to

be with God's children wherever they are located and to support them in a ministry of presence through a sacramental and mediatorial role. For the Christian Navy chaplain, this sacramental and mediatorial role is patterned after the life and ministry of Christ. In essence, it is a relational ministry where the Navy chaplain enters the lived reality of sea service personnel and operates in that demanding environment to represent God's interest and meet the wholistic needs of all of God's children, even though that environment is sometimes antagonistic and hostile to the reign of God. It is primarily an inclusive ministry that recognizes, validates, and supports everyone within a very demanding and structured military system, regardless of race, gender, religious affiliation or non-affiliation.

Sacramental Theology

The sacrament of grace is mediated through the functions of ministry and is often communicated in acceptance and recognition of the worth of the individual over against the demands of the military system. An example of this is illustrative of the lack of control sea service personnel often experience in unexpected and frequent reassignments. This lack of control of one's destiny is inherent in the tension that exists between the service member, the member's family, and the military system. Depending upon one's perspective, this continual movement might be perceived as negative and looked upon as an

obstacle to achieving greater human potential, such as further educational opportunities at higher institutions of learning, dislocation of family members from family and friends, disruption of work resulting in the loss of additional income for the spouse and family, and interruptions in the children's schedule and education. Or it might be perceived as an educational adventure to experience another part of the world. However the move is perceived, it still places demands on the service member and his/her family by realigning priorities and adjusting to a new environment, characteristic of a sense of loss of control of one's destiny.

The sacrament of grace is also symbolized and mediated through functions that represent both traditional Christianity (i.e., preaching, teaching, baptism, the Lord's Supper, marriage, funeral service, etc.) and that which is relevant to the uniqueness of the naval context (i.e., invocations and benedictions at changes of command, retirements, dinners, and at special gatherings, burials at sea, blessings of personnel in routine and combat situations, and evening prayers aboard naval ships while deployed, etc.).

Another important aspect of this type of ministry is assisting sea service personnel in developing coping skills to function and to actualize in this system. Since the demands of the military often place an individual at odds

with the system, coping skills and stress management techniques are needed to alleviate frustration and to make smooth transitions. For instance, take the case of a sailor assigned to a deployable command. The married sailor knows she needs to be a professional sailor and both a mother to her child and a wife to her husband. At the same time she is assigned to a deployable ship and is required to go out to sea with very short notice due to an unexpected national emergency. The military system, by nature of its mission, has created a situation that produces tension and frustration in the marriage. That sailor and her family may require marriage and family counseling to assist them in coping with the unexpected deployment and the hardships it will impose. The personal desires and plans of the sailor and her family are subjugated to the demands of the military system. Hopefully, stress management techniques have been implanted through ongoing proactive workshops and are being practiced even before the announcement is made to get underway. Pastoral care actually begins before the word is announced that the ship is deploying unexpectedly and continues through the deployment. Emergencies and crises surface, and assistance is rendered immediately through pastoral care and counseling.

Navy chaplaincy is predicated upon a strong theology of the pastoral care exhibited in the life and ministry of Christ, and His availability to those experiencing pain.

Similar to Christ's attitude and demonstration of unconditional love, the Navy chaplain exhibits this in pastoral counseling--in Rogerian phraseology as "unconditional positive regard."¹³ Sea service personnel are always regarded positively and dealt with in a manner that will afford them an opportunity to actualize without being condemned or criticized. This presupposes the inherent worth of the individual and capitalizes on the fact that the person is created in the image of God and has the potential to self-actualize when a conducive environment is provided to facilitate such growth. The ministry of pastoral care and counseling affords the Navy chaplain an opportunity to intervene on behalf of the parishioner and utilize "moments that lift us out above ourselves [so we can sense] that we are still under way toward another goal."¹⁴

Dealing with Sin

At this juncture it seems appropriate to discuss my understanding of sin in relation to an expectant theology of pastoral care and counseling, since much of my pastoral counseling and ministry in general deals directly or indirectly with the perception of sin. My view of sin is a state of being in which the commission of evil or harmful

¹³ Carl Rogers, "The Necessary and Sufficient Conditions of Therapeutic Personality Change," in The Carl Rogers Reader, eds. Howard Kirschenbaum and Valerie Land Henderson (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1989), 225.

¹⁴ Wolfhart Pannenberg, What Is Man? (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1970), 67.

human actions and the omission of appropriate and responsible actions are a natural byproduct of one's lack of a faith relationship with God. Subjectified, sin is alienation from God and is manifested in a lack of a relational commitment to God and with God. Objectified, sin is the byproduct of this state of alienation and is revealed in the commission of evil and harmful actions or the omission of appropriate and responsible behavior. Since God is sinless (1 John 3:4-7), God neither produced sin nor manifested sin directly. It has been argued that since God created human beings with the capacity to exercise freedom of choice and because they sinned and became sinful, God became indirectly responsible for the emergence and propagation of sin (i.e., Genesis 3). Yet it can also be argued that God allowed sin to evolve because of the creation of free human agency and God is as much a victim of human sinfulness as are subsequent human beings. Despite the divergent opinions concerning sin's origin and nature, it is a recurring problem exemplified in harmful attitudes and actions and the omission of appropriate and responsible behavior in society that requires acknowledgement, forgiveness, and restitution.

As a Navy chaplain, I have the task of dealing with individual and systemic sins. My role is not to placate either of them, or even to direct my primary focus and energy toward them as such. Rather, my mission is to devise

a method of ministry that acknowledges sin's existence, attempts to suggest ways of correcting individual and systemic sins, and seeks to alleviate human oppression and suffering without appearing to be judgmental and critical of the individual and the system. It is a matter of fighting the fight of faith, rather than fighting the fight against sin, or more specifically--seeking solutions to current problems without being absorbed in the problems themselves.

Also, this style of ministry affords me a margin of job security by allowing me to assist the individual and the system in a solution process that hopefully reconciles the individual and the system without sacrificing my ministry because I ethically disagree with certain functions of the system and subsequently become designated and marked as "anti-Navy." Unlike society, the Navy does not thrive on individuality, freedom of expression, and congruence. Tactful strategies must be devised and implemented that address these issues without sacrificing the pastoral counselor's mission and ministry. This political dimension is not primarily concerned with self-preservation, but more with avoiding the premature termination of the pastoral counselor's mission and ministry on the altar of an unsympathetic commanding officer.

Mission

Mission is crucial to an expectant theology of pastoral care and counseling in Navy chaplaincy in several ways.

Mission implies a specific religious task. It is a term used in the Navy to depict an event that will be realized through the identification of an objective, the formulation of a strategy, and the concerted effort of individuals. Mission presupposes a task. Navy chaplaincy is mandated by law to provide for the "free exercise of religion" for everyone by facilitating divine services to accommodate an individual's faith group. This means I arrange for other religious services for personnel desiring a particular service other than the service I am ordained and equipped to provide, or I make arrangements for them to attend a service offered locally or at another command. And finally, mission in the Navy is global. This does not only mean ministering to sea service personnel located overseas or deployed worldwide. It also means ministering to those outside the Navy where the Navy is in proximity to them, whether in the United States or Third World countries.

Navy chaplains take seriously Christ's great commission to proclaim the gospel worldwide (Matt. 28:16-20). There is some tension inherent in proclaiming and practicing the great commission and in facilitating divine services for other faith groups which are not Christian or contrary to fundamental Christian beliefs. The tension is partially resolved by the recognition of the unifying belief that we are all guaranteed freedom to choose and to practice the religious beliefs and practices we ascribe to, and to

respect the rights of others to do likewise, even if they are contrary to our particular faith group. The First Amendment affords us that right and privilege in the Constitution. However, the essential resolution of the tension is a matter of theological perspective--how one views others in relation to salvation. The former is a legal injunction; the latter is a theological perspective. One may legally conform to the constitutional right to believe and practice according to the dictates of a person's faith and outwardly support individuals in their religious nurture while differing with them theologically. Another may believe that various religions are different paths to the same God and may therefore aid persons in their religious nurture. In either case, inclusiveness is important in theology and in pastoral counseling.

Also, the Navy is concerned with fostering goodwill and alleviating human oppression and suffering, as was evident in Operations Desert Shield and Desert Storm in which I participated. As a non-combatant, I am not required or expected to bear arms. In fact, I am prohibited from carrying a weapon. Whether I believe in a "just war" or not is immaterial since my mission is to minister to all people no matter where they are contextually located and what they intellectually believe. Just because I belong to this particular system does not mean I subscribe to everything the system advocates or does. I testify to my basic belief

of non-violence by being designated as a non-combatant and still providing ministerial support to the men and women of the sea services. People need ministry wherever they are located.

Project Handclasp is another way of fostering goodwill and alleviating human suffering. Project Handclasp is a worldwide goodwill endeavor that attempts to supply people of Third World countries with basic products to survive and a few creature comforts. Navy chaplains coordinate and manage this endeavor. Navy chaplains ensure that an assortment of food, clothing, hygienic supplies, educational materials, and various toys are personally placed in the hands of needy people instead of governmental agencies.

Mission is an integral component of an expectant theology of pastoral care and counseling in the Navy and is an avenue for people to demonstrate "as God is, so God acts." People in mission recognize the task of providing for the needs of everyone, regardless of their religious or non-religious preference and political orientation; people in mission seek to minister to those needs as God seeks to meet everyone's needs, irrespective of their commitment to God.

This task is too overwhelming for Navy chaplains to accomplish solely. Chaplains work in cooperation with other Navy chaplains, ministers, religious leaders, and parishioners of various faith groups to achieve positive

results. Though Navy chaplains are members of particular denominations or faith groups, they recognize the universality of the parenthood of God and the kinship of all people.¹⁵ The Navy Chaplain Corps' motto reflects a cooperative attitude that capitalizes on the things in common and yet retains one's integral and distinctive beliefs--"cooperation without compromise." This would be an excellent motto for the universal Christian community to employ.

Though the Navy considers the chaplain to be diversified and an expert in the field of religion, I see myself as an organizer, facilitator, and participant in ministry, especially in the area of pastoral care and counseling. The concept of the "priesthood of all believers" (1 Pet. 2:9) is the justification and the empowerment for equipping the laity to execute ministry (Romans 12, 1 Corinthians 12, and Ephesians 4). Since the church is a body of believers charismatically gifted for ministry, it is the responsibility of that body to minister along with the spiritual leader. It is also my responsibility to educate, motivate, and facilitate the laity to utilize their gifts in ministry, particularly in the specific domain of pastoral care and counseling.

¹⁵ For a depiction of these facets, see Peter J. Paris, The Social Teaching of the Black Churches (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1985).

Summary

In summary, my understanding of an expectant theology of pastoral care and counseling in Navy chaplaincy essentially focuses on incorporating the affirmation that "as God is, so God acts" with the experience of faith as feeling with a theology of hope. That is, Navy chaplains assist sea service personnel in meeting human needs by responding to crises in tangible ways that reflect God's concern and care for everyone in providing relief and hope in the midst of despair. Navy chaplains provide substantive hope in the tangible assistance they render to everyone. Navy chaplains also model their belief in God's promises to rectify the existential dilemma by faithfully remaining steadfast in the midst of adversity. These promises unite them to the future in expectancy and engender hope in those who suffer.¹⁶

Navy chaplaincy is primarily an incarnational ministry patterned after the Christ, empowered by the Spirit, and created and sustained by God. First and foremost, it is a ministry of presence exhibited in pastoral care and counseling. This ministry derives its justification from an expectant theology of pastoral care and counseling that is future-oriented but contextually located in the present and grounded in a religious community of faith. The Navy chaplain symbolizes the epitome of pastoral care and

¹⁶ Moltmann, 103.

counseling by being incarnationally present and consistently available to assist as needed; the Navy chaplain personifies both hope and promise. The Navy chaplain is a responsible minister of the church, called to represent God to sea service personnel in particular and to the military system at large. The Navy chaplain is accountable to God through the church and the context of the Navy.

CHAPTER 3

The Spiritual Dimension of Selfhood: Toward
a More Wholistic Understanding

I am neither spurred on by excessive optimism nor in love with high ideals, but am merely concerned with the fate of the individual human being--that infinitesimal unit on whom a world depends, and in whom, if we read the meaning of the Christian message aright, even God seeks his [sic] goal.

Carl G. Jung, The Undiscovered Self

From a pastoral counseling perspective, I am of the opinion that far too little attention has been given to the spiritual dimension of the self and its importance for a more wholistic understanding of selfhood in developmental/psychological theories, as well as its appropriate clinical application. Since human beings are by nature wholistic organisms, comprising body, mind, social being, and breath (commonly referred to as spirit in theological jargon), this chapter is devoted to a more wholistic understanding of selfhood by focusing on the validity and development of the spiritual dimension.

As a non-denominational, evangelical, and charismatic Christian Navy chaplain specializing in pastoral counseling, I am especially concerned with the primacy of the notion of a spiritual dimension of selfhood as being essential to the harmonious and wholistic development of the individual. I believe the self is comprised of the spiritual, (as well as the more recognized and developed) social, psychological,

and physical dimensions and that these four dimensions are intrinsically integrated with and interrelated to one another. Since many developmental/psychological theorists have written extensively on the social, psychological, and physical dimensions of selfhood, I direct my attention in this chapter to the existence of the spiritual dimension. I draw analogies with three developmental/psychological theories (even though the theorists do not relate the material to the spiritual dimension). Then I identify certain stages of development of the spiritual dimension via the following three theories: self-in-relation theory as formulated by Janet L. Surrey, object relations theory and the idea of God representations as described by Ana-Maria Rizzuto, and the God archetype in Carl G. Jung's theory of the collective unconscious.

Certain presuppositions and opinions are inherent in this proposition and in this particular method. Fundamental to this endeavor of employing developmental/psychological theories is my contention and aspiration that psychological data and terminology will not only square with, but articulate more concretely, theological beliefs through analogy, correlation, symbolism, and imagery conducive to transcendence, self-actualization, and personal growth. My belief is predicated upon the assumption that the self is composed of a spiritual dimension seeking recognition and expression. Also inherent in this premise is my belief that

the spiritual dimension must be acknowledged and nurtured if an individual is to be integrated into society with minimal traumatic damage. When the spiritual dimension is ignored, downgraded or denied, the human organism, or person, tends to compensate, frequently expressed through substitution. The void is filled with various thoughts, feelings, and behavior which attempt to compensate for the innate relational capacity of the spiritual dimension. These thoughts, feelings, and behavior have both positive and negative consequences. The positive consequences are often expressed when these thoughts, feelings, and behavior are channeled in a healthy direction, while the negative consequences tend to be directed toward self-destructive characteristics, such as addictive traits and behavior.

At this juncture I think it is imperative to define certain key words and phrases to increase clarity. The following definitions are my definitions. Some will seem to be somewhat redundant while others will tend to be enlightening. The word spiritual, as compared to the word religious, is primarily utilized to depict a numinous, mystical, and relational experience with a supreme being or to an ultimate power and with one another. The term religious is selectively and purposefully employed to connote prescribed dogma and practices associated with organized religions and is distinguished from the word spiritual to emphasize its institutional affinity to these

various organized beliefs and practices. God is understood and experienced as a personal supreme being, possessing noble characteristics and superior power, desiring and capable of initiating and maintaining a viable relationship with human beings. This particular delineation of God is not meant to restrict the conception of God by limiting God to "two men and a bird."¹ In fact, this depiction of God as a relational supreme being portrays God as being approachable and affords the individual an opportunity to visualize and conceptualize God in imagery more appropriate to the social location and circumstances of the individual.

The relational capacity of the spiritual dimension of the self and the relational capability of God set the stage for a reciprocal relationship between human beings and God. The rationale for this reciprocal relationship is indicative of the biblical injunction of humanity being created in the imago dei, having both the capacity and capability of fellowship with one another and with the Creator God.²

¹ This descriptive and visual imagery of the Godhead was employed by Suchocki in course lectures. Her point was to illustrate how descriptions of the Godhead as Father, Son, and Spirit need to be expressed in relevant symbols and images appropriate to the social location of individuals' attempts to conceptualize the all-encompassing majesty and mystery of the Godhead.

² The relational implication in the creation myth of Gen. 1:27 is that both the male and female were created equal to one another and with the ability to relate to and communicate with the other and with their Creator. They were created in relationship with one another and with God, and they are capable of maintaining these relationships by certain predetermined factors--God's design and initiative and their

Though many developmental/psychological theorists will often ignore or downplay the need for the divine relationship, all will acknowledge the necessity of human relationships. The indisputable fact remains that the self is relational and part of a wholistic organism which demands expression via relationship. The separate self, generally epitomized by many males in Western cultures as seeking isolation and individualism, is also a relational self, predominately manifested in numerous females in multi-cultures, seeking connection with others.³ This innate capacity for connection with others is the fundamental link uniting the spiritual dimension with the relational self motif, as described by the developers of the self-in-relation theory promoted by Stone Center advocates, such as Janet L. Surrey.

Self-in-Relation Theory: A Spiritual Twist

Janet L. Surrey, a project consultant and research associate at the Stone Center, Wellesley College, postulates the theory of self-in-relation that provides a new perspective for viewing the self as a relational self. Though Surrey is specifically applying this concept to a theory of women's development and not making connections with spirituality, my assumption is that certain key features hold true for a developmental understanding of the

freedom of choice.

³ Judith V. Jordan, et al., eds., introduction to Women's Growth in Connection: Writings from the Stone Center (New York: Guilford, 1991), 1-7.

spiritual dimension of the self for both women and men.

In her article, "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development," Surrey states that "the self is organized and developed in the context of important relationships."⁴ She identifies the mother-daughter relationship as the most important foundational relationship for women. This is due at first to the mother meeting the essential needs of the infant, both anticipated and voiced felt needs, and thereafter to the daughter when she is evolving into a woman through the mother's inherent capacity for emotional connectedness with her.⁵ The mother identifies with the daughter and feels with her and for her. Empathy, or emotional relatedness, seems to be spontaneous and natural (though there is definitely an element of effort involved since the mother attempts to enter the daughter's world via her own previous experience).

This empathetic relatedness is both cognitive and affective--cognitive in the sense that the mother identifies mutually and intellectually with her daughter's physical and emotional development and affectively in that the mother intuitively feels what the daughter is experiencing. The mother is perceived by the daughter as the ultimate

⁴ Janet L. Surrey, "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development," in Women's Growth in Connection: Writings from the Stone Center, eds. Judith V. Jordan et al., (New York: Guilford, 1991), 52.

⁵ Surrey, 56.

caretaker, the epitome of omniscience and "mutual empowerment," and Surrey says that "the emotional and cognitive connections based on shared understanding develop over time into a mutual process in which both mothers and daughters become highly responsive to the feeling states of each other."⁶ This continues from infancy through the evolutionary stages leading to adulthood.

In my opinion, this particular scenario, though characteristic of the mother-daughter relationship, is also suggestive of the spiritual dimension in the portrayal of a God representation by the mother. Metaphorically, the mother humanly represents the God figure. During infancy, the mother, like God, is viewed as omniscient and even, to limited degree, omnipotent because she is able to perceive basic and felt needs and capable of fulfilling those needs with resources which are appropriate and satisfying. As the mother is actively engaged in the developmental process of the daughter, seeking to meet needs and to connect emotionally with her, so too is God.

Presuming that the mother is more or less psychologically healthy, she represents and models God through her openness and responsiveness to her daughter's need. The daughter learns to trust the mother and responds to her consistent faithfulness. She learns to experience God's faithfulness through the mother's modeling. The

⁶ Surrey, 56.

opposite may transpire if the mother is psychologically unstable. The daughter may learn to distrust the mother and to respond negatively to her inconsistent faithfulness. She may learn to distrust God because of the mother's inability to meet the daughter's needs. The positive role-modeling possibilities are predicated on the assumption that the mother is psychologically stable and that she is able to bond emotionally with her daughter.

The relationship is emotional and experiential. As time progresses, the daughter ventures out from the mother to explore new vistas and to establish a sense of identity independent of the mother, still very much emotionally connected to the mother, though often ignored or even denied. Love, in appreciation for and response to the mother's faithfulness, can continue to unite the two while the daughter ventures out to explore and to experience the meaning of life. Insofar as the mother models this open and connected relationship, she personifies God and reflects God's attributes. The daughter, and even a son, will experience God through the positive mirroring of the mother's faithfulness.

The relationship between mother and daughter is not abrogated in this apparent venturing out process. The relationship may actually be enhanced due to the daughter's freedom to expand her horizons and the knowledge that the mother is perceived as almost always available and

emotionally connected even during periods when the daughter does not feel close to the mother. This venturing out process is an opportunity to define and establish parameters and to redefine the relationship in terms of experience, trust, and maturity--three key features of spiritual maturity.

Though the relationship appears to be a process of separation from, it is, in all actuality, a circuitous route of emotional connectedness back to the mother in a more experiential and mature manner, similar to the experience of the prodigal son who ventures out to experience the pleasures of life only to realize that the joy of connectedness to the father was far greater than the pleasures and disappointments of the world.⁷ This entire process is a cycle of oscillating relationships, interspersed with periods of closeness and separation, indicative of our spiritual relationship with God. In other words, the process is from dependency to interdependency--an apt depiction illustrative of the concept of the self in relationship with God. Surrey would prefer to call it "an evolutionary process of development through relationship. Such language is used to differentiate this notion from a static self construct and to describe an experiential process implying openness, flexibility, and change."⁸

⁷ Luke 15:11-32.

⁸ Surrey, 59.

Object Relations Theory: The God Representation

While the static self construct remains rigid and inflexible, the experiential process is open to change and is flexible. This experiential process can be played out in the confines of the psyche through the concept of illusion, where creativity and potential are fueled by desire. William Meissner, a psychoanalyst and a Jesuit priest, believes that illusion may be the arena where individuals experience the greatest potential for growth. Ana-Maria Rizzuto, a training and supervising psychoanalyst at the Psychoanalytic Institute of New England, East, quotes Meissner as saying,

Psychoanalysis no longer feels compelled to destroy man's [sic] illusions on the grounds that they express his inmost desires and wishes. Rather psychoanalysis has moved to the position of staking a claim for illusion as the repository of human creativity and the realm in which man's [sic] potentiality may find its greatest and most meaningful expression.⁹

One would expect Meissner to advocate this since he is essentially the first psychoanalyst to propose an extensively balanced developmental conceptualization of religious experience.¹⁰ As an object relations theorist, he provides some form of conceptual framework for God to surface. Being a psychoanalyst, illusion is both a logical

⁹ William Meissner (1978), cited by Ana-Maria Rizzuto in The Birth of the Living God: A Psychoanalytic Study (Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1979), 227.

¹⁰ Rizzuto, 182.

and an appropriate conceptual framework to understand God, especially since Sigmund Freud, the founder of the psychoanalytic movement, addressed the significance of religion and religious experience in his book, The Future of an Illusion. Because Freud addressed the dogmatic nature and often negative consequences of religion and religious experience instead of distinguishing between religion/religious and spirit/spiritual, he relegated its contributions to only a few aspirations--societal harmony being one of the more notable ones.¹¹ Fortunately, Meissner and other object relations theorists modify Freud's psychology of religion to include a more positive representation of God.

Ana-Maria Rizzuto continues to build on this positive representation of God. In her book, The Birth of the Living God: A Psychoanalytic Study, she examines the formation of the God representation in human development. As a result of research and empirical studies, Freud opted for the illusion of science over the illusion of religion. Rizzuto rejects "the Freud who said: 'No, our science is no illusion. But an illusion it would be to suppose that what science cannot give us we can get elsewhere.'"¹² She does, however, accept the Freud who said, "The idea of a single great god--an idea

¹¹ Sigmund Freud, The Future of an Illusion (New York: W. W. Norton, 1961), 65-71.

¹² Rizzuto, 212.

which must be recognized as a completely justified memory, . . . has a compulsive character: it must be believed."¹³ Possibly Carl Jung's construct of the God archetype resident in the collective unconscious is reflected here in Freud's thought.¹⁴ Though Freud did not accept this aspect of Jung, this particular depiction of God is more compatible with the idea of the spiritual dimension than the religious notion, which seems to be what Freud actually resisted and eventually rejected. The spiritual dimension connotes openness and responsiveness to God through experience, while the religious notion implies a structured dogmatic behaviorism derived from canonical law associated with established religions.

Rizzuto delineates seven critical theses to substantiate her premise that God is "an illusionary transitional object" who comes into existence in what Winnicott calls "transitional space."¹⁵ Rizzuto is helpful in clarifying Winnicott's transitional space by describing it as "the space for illusion, where art, culture, and religion belong. That is the place where man's [sic] life finds the full relevance of his objects and meaning for

¹³ Rizzuto, 212.

¹⁴ The relevance of this concept in the development of the spiritual aspect of the self will be addressed in the next section of this chapter, "The God Archetype in the Collective Unconscious."

¹⁵ Quoted by Rizzuto, 177.

himself [sic]."¹⁶ A summary of her seven theses is also helpful in understanding the importance of God representations and the concept of illusion.

1. Children create an object representation of God in psychic space where transitional objects have real illusionary existence.

2. God is located "simultaneously 'outside, inside and at the border,'" as are all transitional objects.

3. As "a special transitional object," God is created from "representational materials" whose sources are from familiar "primary objects."

4. God does not follow the course of other transitional objects by being decathected and "relegated to limbo" over time.

5. Until death, God is created and found in and through the psychic processes as a "personalized representational transitional object."

6. In our culture God is the "cultural creation. . . for reelaboration of those primary ties" that are with us until we die.

7. Our sense of self is affected by our private images of the representational traits of God.¹⁷

Thus far, it appears that God is merely a figment of one's imagination, a noble aspiration, or wish, projected

¹⁶ Rizzuto, 209.

¹⁷ Rizzuto, 177-80.

into reality through one's creative psychic processes. This is due to the presupposition that the term illusion conveys a magical connotation implying deception. Rizzuto is helpful here in addressing this issue. She maintains that "reality and illusion are not contradictory terms. Psychic reality . . . cannot occur without that specifically human transitional space for play and illusion."¹⁸

What bearing does this have on pastoral counseling and what are the implications of Rizzuto's concept of the God representation? I believe Winnicott said it well and very succinctly when he wrote, "I suggest that an important basis for ego development lies in this area of the individual's communicating with subjective phenomena, which alone gives the feeling of real."¹⁹ Spiritual experience, as contrasted to religious experience, seems to convey this more subjective and mystical notion of reality because it tends to defy objectification, whereas the religious experience tends to connote an established and codified dogma of beliefs and practices that is inherently objective. I believe this has positive implications for mental health and the reassessment of certain dysfunctional behavior. Spiritual experience helps to establish certain experiences and behavior as spiritually credible rather than

¹⁸ Rizzuto, 209.

¹⁹ D. W. Winnicott, The Maturation Processes and the Facilitating Environment: Studies in the Theory of Emotional Development (New York: International Univ. Press, 1965), 188.

dysfunctional.

To a large degree, our image of God is shaped by parental figures, significant others and their positive and negative influences on us, and, as Erik Erikson's epigenetic principle reveals, a "gradual unfolding of the personality through phase-specific psychosocial crises."²⁰ What this means is that our God representations have been formulated by genetic disposition, our association with significant others, and our cultural and environmental interaction. In other words, our God representations are preconditioned by who we are biologically and what we experience environmentally.

An example of this might be a Down Syndrome child who has a loving and trusting relationship with a kind and caring father. The child is genetically disposed to be loving and trusting. The kind and caring father represents God to the child. For all practical purposes, the father, in the form of a significant other, personifies God to the child. Conversely, certain mental illnesses and dysfunctional behavior can result from genetic disposition, improper parental mirroring, dysfunctional religious beliefs and practices, and negative cultural and environmental factors. In such a case, positive reinforcement of experiences lived out in psychic reality through play and

²⁰ Erik H. Erikson, Identity and the Life Cycle (New York: International Univ. Press, 1959), 119.

illusion and fortified through life-enhancing spiritual disciplines, religious beliefs, and practices may possibly compensate by overriding the negative influences.

Rizzuto does a noteworthy job of synthesizing and meshing Freud's psychoanalytic view of development with Erikson's stages. She employs Erikson's terminology to correspond to the various developmental stages by providing examples of religious experience in a chart she develops depicting the "sense of self and the successive recreations of his [sic] transitional objects."²¹ The key issue here is the continuous reshaping of the God representations. These God representations are expressed in religious experiences throughout the respective stages of life.²²

If, in the course of development, this reshaping is not done continuously, the individual's perception of the God representation may become fixed, confused, and distorted due to defense mechanisms inherent in the individual, thereby resulting in inadequate perceptions of "the illusion of God" and the subsequent illusion of reality. Mental illness and dysfunctional behavior may result from a lack of continuous reshaping due to static and dogmatic fixation. Or just the opposite may happen; too much reshaping too quickly may cause confusion and distort the individual's value system

²¹ Rizzuto, 206-07.

²² Rizzuto, 206-07. See Rizzuto's chart which provides a more detailed description of the progressive nature of religious experience.

because too much data is coming too quickly to be analyzed with life experiences and assimilated with thought and behavior. If, however, reshaping is done gradually, the individual tends to own the process as their own system of valuation and implements changes which are compatible with their psychic and constitutional structures. This is where religions possess the potential for either healing or injury. They provide options concerning the various directions an individual may desire to pursue. Yet, at the same time, they may be perceived as limiting factors, since the numerous religions may not address the person's unique cognitive, affective, and constitutional dispositions.

An apt illustration of this is the feminist movement in Christianity. Women are expressing concern over the stereotypical portrayal of the male image of God. For some, especially those abused by males, the imagery of a gender-specific male God is detrimental or even repulsive to their perception of an accepting and loving deity and their emotional well-being. Another significant factor is the lack of an image of God that represents any femaleness. Women's defense mechanisms will often tend toward either fighting or taking flight. That is, they may rebel against the notion of a male deity, espoused predominately by white male European theologians, and voice their resistance by constructing a feminine representation of God. Or, they may reject the premise that God exists altogether.

The guiding principle is that one's God representation must be congruent with one's uniqueness and evolutionary developmental stages and personify a healthy perspective from the religious community and society at large. This means gender, culture, ethnicity, and a host of other variables must be considered in the equation before one is diagnosed as emotionally and spiritually healthy or mentally and spiritually ill.²³ Spiritual and religious experiences can have either a positive or negative impact on the individual and one's diagnosis.

The God Archetype in the Collective Unconscious

In an article entitled, "The Anthropology of Carl Jung: Implications for Pastoral Care," Swanee Hunt asserts that Jung's idea of God as an archetype differs radically from contemporary psychological theories. Jung not only postulates the universal presence of God as an archetype, but he also regards "this phenomenon as healthy rather than pathological."²⁴ Jung maintains that God is "an archetype that cannot be ignored or denied."²⁵ Hunt goes on to say that Jung believes "God is both beyond our ken and deep

²³ David Augsburger helps clarify the significance of diversity of gender, ethnicity, and cultural issues in pastoral counseling. See Augsburger, Pastoral Counseling Across Cultures.

²⁴ Swanee Hunt, "The Anthropology of Carl Jung: Implications for Pastoral Care" in Jung and Christianity in Dialogue: Faith, Feminism, and Hermeneutics, eds. Robert L. Moore and Daniel J. Meckel (Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist, 1990), 242.

²⁵ Hunt, 242.

within us, a psychic reality. God is our center, the point at which the beginning of our whole psychic life seems to be rooted."²⁶ Hunt also points out that Jung believes in the intrapsychic existence of God but that he is unable to distinguish God's psychic reality from the self archetype of "God within us."²⁷

The problem with this view is that Jung contends that the self archetype is "God within us," but he is also reluctant to definitely say that the self archetype is in essence "God within us."²⁸ He fails to distinguish between God and the self archetype. Jung seems to consolidate them under the rubric of the self and then also seems to contradict himself by saying God is both "beyond our ken and deep within us," implying an objective and subjective reality for God that is not bound by the parameters or limitations of the self.

Jung's structural description of the psyche will shed some light on this dilemma. Jung describes the psyche as having three dimensions. The first dimension is the "collective unconscious" where "we encounter archetypal themes and symbols, bringing us the wisdom of all experience

²⁶ Hunt, 242.

²⁷ Carl G. Jung, Two Essays on Analytical Psychology, vol. 7 of The Collected Works of C. G. Jung, 2nd ed., trans. R. F. C. Hull (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1966), par. 399.

²⁸ Hunt, 242.

of all the ages past."²⁹ Jung's definition of "archetypal themes and symbols" is difficult to nail down because his lack of distinction between archetype and archetypal image adds to the ambiguity. However, he does say archetypes are the unconscious images of instincts.³⁰ Jung goes on to explain that "they are patterns of instinctual behavior."³¹

A more contemporary analogy might be that of a computer. The computer represents the collective unconscious and the various programs installed in the computer would symbolize the various archetypes imbedded in our psyches. These programs remain unconscious to the novice who receives a preprogrammed computer from the retailer. They may become known when they are studied and accessed through proper predesignated computer commands initiated by the enlightened computer wizard. Likewise, the archetypes and archetypal images surface from the collective unconscious when they are activated by certain instinctual impulses experienced by the individual. When they surface as dreams, desires or behavior they are experimented with until they are recognized, explained, and owned by the participant.

²⁹ Hunt, 236.

³⁰ Carl G. Jung, The Archetypes and the Collective Unconscious, vol. 9.1 of The Collected Works of C. G. Jung, 2nd ed., trans. R. F. C. Hull (Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1959), par. 91.

³¹ Jung, Archetypes and the Collective Unconscious, 91.

The second dimension of the psyche is consciousness. Consciousness is essentially perception. The ego is part of this but not all of it. The ego emerges out of the collective unconscious in the form of a mask, or persona, and in the course of evolutionary maturity, develops "a conscious ego that is distinct from the unconscious persona, no longer feigning individuality, but rather meeting and accepting into consciousness all parts of oneself."³² As the conscious ego develops and gains strength, it accepts or rejects material from the unconscious and interprets archetypal images from dreams, fantasies, and projections.³³

The third and final dimension of the psyche is the personal unconscious where "the material that the ego is not strong enough to accept is repressed."³⁴ This is where various memories and painful experiences are repressed.

What does all of this mean and how can this material be used in pastoral counseling to identify and enhance the development of spirituality? Jung visualizes intrapsychic wholeness to mean growth toward the development of the individual personality that separates one's conscious self from one's unconscious archetypal images that lead to "blind illusions." He calls this process individuation and maintains that it is absolutely necessary for the

³² Hunt, 236.

³³ Hunt, 236.

³⁴ Jung, Two Essays, 365.

actualization of human potential and the well-being of society.³⁵ The significance of Jung's contribution to pastoral counseling and contemporary psychotherapy is the supposition that God is a universal archetype in the collective unconscious psyche of everyone, and that the spiritual dimension of the self is not only located at the center of the self, but that it needs to be recognized, owned, and nurtured if the individual is to experience a healthy form of existence and individuation.

The implications for utilizing religious beliefs, practices, and rituals as therapeutic tools to effectuate transcendence, self-actualization, and personal growth are astounding! An example of this might be the use of religious ritual in facilitating healing in a traumatic divorce. If an individual is exhibiting dysfunctional behavior due to a traumatic divorce, a possible therapeutic tool may be a service of ending or mourning for the ex-spouse or the marriage. This would allow the divorcee an opportunity to experience closure in the relationship, aid in the grieving process, and provide an impetus to press on in life. Since the divorcee needs to grieve appropriately, the religious ritual may provide such an opportunity to tap into that psychological and spiritual dimensions and afford a conducive environment for healing and personal growth.

³⁵ Hunt, 239.

Conclusion

The three theories of the self discussed in this chapter appear to be compatible with the spiritual realities of selfhood. Though certain theological issues have not been explicitly addressed in this chapter, such as morality, it is my assumption that the spiritual dimension of the self will eventually provide a sounding-board to critique our thoughts and actions, and it will ultimately provide direction for the human organism to move toward moral behavior. This is where various spiritual disciplines and religious beliefs and practices come into play as possible therapeutic tools in shaping and reshaping the personality of the individual in conforming to acceptable and conducive societal standards. When the spiritual dimension is ignored, down-played or denied, the human organism seeks to compensate by filling the void with secular concerns, some of which are beneficial but not necessarily moral in the religious sense. Therefore, it becomes imperative to recognize and nurture spirituality in order for wholistic growth and potential to be realized.

In conclusion, how appropriate are the words of the Christ when He addressed the Pharisee Nicodemus concerning spiritual rebirth, "The wind bloweth where it listeth, and thou hearest the sound thereof, but canst not tell whence it cometh, and whither it goeth: so is every one born of the Spirit" (John 3:8). These words stress the uniqueness of

the Spirit and the work of the Spirit with and in humanity. They capture the mystical and numinous dimensions of the work of the Spirit by indicating how elusive the Spirit is and how difficult it is to get a handle on the Spirit and the Spirit's work.

I believe we are divinely created works of art through the elusive influence and ministry of the Spirit. As created beings, we are endowed with certain innate characteristics, possessing the capacity to respond to God through the continual influence and ministry of the Spirit. I believe that spirituality is the dimension of selfhood that has been preprogrammed with a homing device that seeks a relationship with God for communion and self-actualization. When spirituality is afforded credulity, it provides more fullness to selfhood; this is important to a wholistic paradigm of body, mind, social being, and spirit. Spirituality expresses a more wholistic understanding of selfhood that addresses the whole person.

CHAPTER 4

Utilizing Spirituality in Pastoral Counseling: An
Integration of Spirituality and Psychotherapy

Two definitions require attention and explication before an adequate description is rendered of the pastoral counselor as a practitioner of spirituality. First, the pastoral counselor is typically a minister of a Christian Church or other religious institution who provides counseling to people experiencing emotional and physical dysfunctions that impair their ability to function fully in their personal or societal sphere. Howard J. Clinebell, Jr., says the goal of pastoral counseling is "to help people handle their problems of living more adequately and grow toward fulfilling their potentialities."¹ He identifies a fundamental need indicative to all: "whatever the particular causes, such persons are unable to relate in ways that satisfy their need for the fundamental foods of the spirit."²

It is here that spirituality emerges and requires definition. Bradley C. Hanson is helpful in postulating a workable definition by proposing four poignant elements to be implemented into a viable definition of spirituality.

¹ Howard J. Clinebell Jr., Basic Types of Pastoral Counseling: New Resources for Ministering to the Troubled (Nashville: Abingdon, 1966), 20.

² Clinebell, Basic Types of Pastoral Counseling, 20.

First, he uses Joann Wolski Conn's description of spirituality as "our capacity for self-transcendence, a capacity demonstrated in our ability to know the truth, to relate to others lovingly, and to commit ourselves freely to persons and ideals."³ Secondly, Hanson identifies the spiritual core as "the deepest center of the person. It is here that the person is open to the transcendent dimension; it is here that the person experiences ultimate reality."⁴ Hanson's third element is taken from Sandra Schneiders' work dealing with self-transcendence "by situating and orienting the person within the horizon of ultimacy in some ongoing and transforming way."⁵ Hanson continues to narrow spirituality down in this third description to faith. Everyone has faith in something, and that faith in something is the driving force in people's lives, regardless if it is termed sacred or secular. For Schneiders and Hanson, faith is viewed as a "master commitment" that "influences all aspects of a person's life, and also serves to unify a person's life by setting up the priorities of one's existence. It might be clearer to say that spirituality is

³ Bradley C. Hanson, "Spirituality as Spiritual Theology," 46.

⁴ See Ewert Cousins, preface to the series, in Christian Spirituality: Origins to the Twelfth Century, eds. Bernard McGinn and John Meyendorff, World Spirituality, vol. 16 (New York: Crossroad, 1985), xiii.

⁵ See Sandra M. Schneiders, "Theology and Spirituality: Strangers, Rivals, or Partners?" Horizons 13, no. 2 (1986): 266.

. . . faith."⁶ And finally, spirituality is a "lived reality," or an "experience."⁷ To simplify Hanson's understanding of spirituality, he says spirituality is the capacity for self-transcendence in which a person experiences ultimate reality through faith in the context of a lived reality.⁸

The implications for the pastoral counselor to function as a practitioner of spirituality are self-evident. However, the practical aspects of this concept need some developing. Since the pastoral counselor's primary goal is to assist the client in managing his/her problems in order that the client can function more adequately and self-actualize, it is imperative that the pastoral counselor model and participate in spiritual practices, personally and professionally. This modeling affords the client an opportunity to visualize spirituality as a viable option that demonstrates stability, purpose, and hope. When the client realizes that spirituality is applicable to everyone, since all are created wholistically (i.e., body, mind, social being, and spirit), hopefully he/she will desire to participate in spiritual practices to transcend previously experienced limitations and pain and to experience instead the joy of freedom from emotional and physical dysfunctions.

⁶ Hanson, "Spirituality as Spiritual Theology," 47.

⁷ Hanson, "Spirituality as Spiritual Theology," 47.

⁸ Hanson, "Spirituality as Spiritual Theology," 50.

Both the modeling of spirituality by the pastoral counselor and the participation in spiritual practices by the client are essential elements in effecting the client's transformation. The familiar principle of "by beholding we become changed" is tantamount. Nevertheless, at this juncture it is crucial that the pastoral counselor remain open to the client and not assume that the client's spirituality must be exhibited in a religious context or be framed in religious jargon. To do so could limit understanding and impair growth. Clinebell is helpful in distinguishing when it is appropriate to use religious resources by delineating nine guidelines.⁹

The pastoral counselor must be genuine and consistent with his/her fundamental religious beliefs, but always open to other forms and expressions of spirituality without being intimidated or threatened. This requires a strong sense of self-identity and a willingness to explore new and different dimensions of spirituality. If spiritual practices are to be employed as credible healing agencies in psychotherapy, they must be afforded the same respect that various theories and practices of psychotherapy are allowed. Spirituality must be viewed as a credible discipline that has credence and applicability to other disciplines instead of merely being relegated to religion alone. This demands some

⁹ See Clinebell, Basic Types of Pastoral Care and Counseling, 122-23.

radical rethinking.

The Relevancy of Spirituality in Psychotherapy

Few psychotherapists believe spirituality and spiritual practices can benefit psychotherapy. Irving M. Rosen is one of those exceptions. He is careful to distinguish spirituality from religion. In a paper Rosen presented entitled "The Spiritual Dimension of Cognitive Therapy," he said, "Spirituality appears to be basic to and different from religion."¹⁰ Rosen then describes three aspects of spirituality:

One aspect of its meaning concerns the nature of the person as a total organism unreduced; yet another aspect points to the emerging witnessing Self referred to in meditational or transpersonal psychology; and yet another aspect concerns itself with the disappearance of this Self in the enlightenment phase.¹¹

After describing these three significant aspects, he constructs a spectrum of consciousness "moving from the body level to the ego level where various therapies attempt to create a healthy and responsible ego by healing splits and meeting developmental needs."¹² Furthermore, Rosen

¹⁰ Irving M. Rosen, "The Spiritual Dimension of Cognitive Therapy," Journal of Religion and Health 30 (Summer 1991):94. Rosen is the Director of the Religion and Psychiatry Clinic at Butler Hospital in Providence, Rhode Island. He presented this paper on the relevancy of spirituality in psychotherapy as part of a symposium in "Spirituality and Psychotherapy" at the Annual Convention of the American Psychiatric Association in New York on May 14, 1990.

¹¹ Rosen, 94.

¹² Rosen, 94.

maintains:

The ego is then able to effectuate the emergence of a growing, resilient, balanced, purposeful whole person with constructive attitudes, who can find meaning, come through suffering, commit to trust and love, and deal effectively with stress and the stress emotions of anxiety, anger, guilt, shame, and grief.¹³

Then he draws it all together under the dominion of spirituality by stating, "The field comprising the Whole Person, Witnessing Self, and Beyond Self appears to be the domain of spirituality."¹⁴

Spirituality strives to develop the whole person. Through time immemorial, people have employed various methods in achieving spiritual ecstasy. Some have focused exclusively on the cultivation of the interior life, as opposed to the external life with its communal orientation and responsibility. Others have centered on the outer dimension of spirituality that sees action in the world as the model that truly represents the essence of spirituality. Integration is the key, as it is in the implementation of spirituality in psychotherapy.

Margaret R. Miles is beneficial here in integrating the seemingly bipolar natures of the interior and exterior lives by asserting that the

cultivation of one's self or soul cannot be an end in itself in a nuclear world. The contemporary practice of Christianity cannot have

¹³ Rosen, 94.

¹⁴ Rosen, 94.

as its goal individual happiness or even, in the traditional term, individual salvation. Rather, in the nuclear world, an "examined life" is a moral responsibility. A life before God in our time requires a degree of social responsibility far greater than that recognized by most historical Christian writers.¹⁵

For Miles, the practice of Christianity is one unique expression of spirituality, distinguished as Christian spirituality. She is concerned that Christian spirituality integrate the interior and exterior lives. Though she is well aware of the transcendent nature of the self, she desires to hold it accountable to the emerging world situation to avoid individualism and escapism.¹⁶

Both Miles, as a historical theologian, and Rosen, as a practicing psychiatrist, perceive spirituality as contributing to balance, wholeness, responsibility, and transcendence. These four elements, in my opinion, are indispensable elements in effective psychotherapy.

Rosen contends that religious and spiritual literature were available long before the advent of dynamic psychiatry, preventing people from succumbing to negative or stress emotions.¹⁷ According to Rosen, "Forgiveness and reconciliation, confession and atonement, mourning and faithfulness are ways frequently expounded for dealing with

¹⁵ Margaret R. Miles, Practicing Christianity: Critical Perspectives for an Embodied Spirituality (1988; reprint, New York: Crossroad, 1990), 3.

¹⁶ Miles, 177.

¹⁷ Rosen, 96.

the emotions as existential realities."¹⁸

"Whole person emotions" are significant issues for Rosen. He considers "loneliness, boredom, and meaninglessness to be whole person emotions."¹⁹ Then he illustrates and contrasts these emotions and interjects the positive factor that meditation "still[s] the mind" long enough to listen to one's self.²⁰ Meditation promotes enlightenment. According to Rosen, few people attain it. Expectations of perfection, disappointment, and even exhaustion may result from attempting to reach this ideal, yet the positive component of meditation in achieving the enlightenment phase "enhance[s] feelings of belonging and compassion."²¹

To echo Rosen's conclusion of the relevancy of spirituality for psychotherapy, and specifically cognitive therapy:

there are four words that are keys to the concept of spirituality as it relates to cognition. The words are responsibility, perspective, reality, and transcendence. Spirituality thus considered is not fuzzy, escapist, irrational, unreal, or irrelevant. It is exactly the opposite.²²

In light of the preceding analysis it seems only reasonable

¹⁸ Rosen, 96.

¹⁹ Rosen, 96.

²⁰ Rosen, 96.

²¹ Rosen, 97.

²² Rosen, 97.

to conclude that both spirituality, in the broadest sense, and psychotherapy, in the narrowest sense, endeavor to achieve ultimately the same goal--the wholistic restoration of the person in order that self-actualization and integration into society are functionally achieved.

A Symmetrization of Spirituality and Cognitive Therapy

The word symmetrization has been selected for this section because it characterizes the compatible dimensions of spirituality and cognitive therapy in juxtaposition. Since spirituality has been theologically defined in the first section and its relevancy to psychotherapy delineated in the second section, it seems natural and germane to compare its corollary components with selected and pertinent aspects of cognitive therapy. Unfortunately, neither time nor space allows extensive development to occur. Nonetheless, pertinent material will be addressed and illuminated.

Before proceeding, a workable definition of cognitive therapy seems appropriate. Lewis R. Wolberg, M.D., is helpful here in condensing this convoluted therapy into a brief description of its essential nature and purpose.

In contrast to dynamic therapy that tends to alter cognitions through insight into how past conditionings mold attitudes and behaviors, cognitive therapy deals directly with present-day thoughts, irrational assumptions, destructive self-statements and self-defeating ideas. Their influence on feelings and behavior is explored with the object of regulating a more harmonious adjustment and helping the patient reduce or eliminate anxiety, depression, anger, and

accompanying physiological residues.²³

Wolberg's succinct definition of the fundamental tenets and purpose of cognitive therapy is useful in synthesizing a very complex psychotherapy.

Another helpful insight into cognitive therapy is provided by David D. Burns, M.D., in his book: Feeling Good: The New Mood Therapy. He says that all moods are created by cognitions, which he identifies as thoughts, and says "A cognition refers to the way you look at things--your perceptions, mental attitudes and beliefs. It includes the way you interpret things--what you say about something or someone to yourself."²⁴

Jacqueline B. Persons, a practicing cognitive behavior therapist and assistant clinical professor in the Department of Psychiatry at the University of California in San Francisco, encapsulates the theory and purpose of cognitive therapy in a functional model which she designates as "the case formulation model." She postulates that psychological problems occur at two levels: "overt difficulties" and "underlying psychological mechanisms." Overt difficulties are real life problems, such as depression, suicidal thoughts, etc. Underlying psychological mechanisms are the deficits that cause overt difficulties, often expressed as

²³ Lewis R. Wolberg, The Practice of Psychotherapy: 506 Questions and Answers (New York: Brunner/Mazel, 1982), 108.

²⁴ David D. Burns, Feeling Good: The New Mood Therapy (New York: Signet, 1981), 11.

one's irrational beliefs about self, such as "unless I am perfect in everything I do, I will fail."²⁵ She further states that problems can be classified in terms of three components: cognition, behavior, and mood. Persons then hypothesize an interdependence among these three components in a "synchronous relationship" in which a change in any one of the three components is likely to produce changes in the other components.²⁶ Once she has developed this concept, she presents her crucial thesis.

The interdependence hypothesis is supported by studies showing that interventions at one system appear to produce changes in all systems. Zeiss, Lewinsohn, and Munoz (1979) treated depressed patients with cognitive therapy, behavior therapy, or social skills interventions. Patients did not show a superior treatment response in the system that was treated; instead, they showed changes in all systems. Rehm, Kaslow, and Rabin (1987) and Simons, Garfield, and Murphy (1984) reported similar results.²⁷

Persons is careful to note that strategies for directly manipulating moods have not been developed, but she believes that they can be altered by employing the interdependence hypothesis.²⁸

In light of the foregoing, it seems appropriate to address the correlation and applicability of spirituality to

²⁵ Jacqueline B. Persons, Cognitive Therapy in Practice: A Case Formulation Approach (New York: W. W. Norton, 1989), 1.

²⁶ Persons, 4-5.

²⁷ Persons, 5.

²⁸ Persons, 5.

this particular model of cognitive therapy, although time and space prohibit elaborate development. To recapitulate the adopted theological definition of spirituality, it is a capacity for self-transcendence in which a person experiences ultimate reality through faith in the context of a lived reality. Since both Wolberg and Persons identify dysfunctional cognitions as irrational or distorted ideas, it is apparent that the client's perception of reality is skewed by faulty and exaggerated notions. The cognitive therapist's primary function is to assist in the correction of these distorted cognitions by replacing them with positive ones. Though the preponderance of cognitive therapists are not concerned about the origin of these faulty cognitions, as psychoanalysts are, the cognitive therapists are interested in altering the cognitive process to produce cognitions compatible with sound mental health and ultimate self-actualization. Helping the client to restructure the cognitive process in a logical manner, thereby changing cognitions, moods, and behavior, could be enhanced by engaging in practices of spirituality. This will be expounded upon in the concluding section of this chapter under the heading "A Synergistic Paradigm for Pastoral Counseling."

Considering that spirituality includes an aspiration to transcend the self, spiritual practices could be engaged in conjunction with cognitive therapy to move the client beyond

his/her distortion of reality. Both spirituality and cognitive therapy attempt to reorient the client in ultimate reality, as opposed to perceived reality. The phrase ultimate reality refers to a reality that is in touch with the inner core of human existence and the empirical data of the contemporary situation. This empirical data is not restricted to individual interpretation and ultimate reality is not even fully revealed in the empirical data itself. But the collective analysis of a community, based upon observation, and can be utilized as one criterion to establish normalcy and aberrations. Perceived reality pertains to a reality that is discerned real by the psyche of the individual. Individual interpretation, with or without substantiating external evidence, is the determining factor. The collective analysis of a community may or may not be considered necessary or even reliable.

Faith can be important to cognitive therapy by assisting the client's transformation. Just how this is accomplished is by the counselor and client's seeking and trusting the driving, or motivational force, that is inherent in everyone, though often dormant in many. That drive, or force, can be identified and resurrected by practicing spirituality. Faith must not be limited, or confined, to a theological or religious belief. Faith can transcend religion and frequently does in the secular world. Faith is essentially trust, whether it is trust in a supreme

being or power, or whether it is trust in one's self or the things a person uses to journey through life. For instance, faith in God could assist an individual in dealing with the adversities of life by navigating through them without becoming bitter. Faith also provides stability and direction for the secular client in using opportunities to trust other people or things, such as the person who trusts an automobile for safe and reliable transportation. The crucial elements are trust and hope.

From a pastoral counseling perspective, faith is primarily conceived of as "the substance of things hoped for, the evidence of things not seen" (Heb. 11:1). Though this specific description of faith is exceptionally general and could be adopted by most people, it still carries a particular theological or religious connotation that may be offensive to some. The pastoral counselor can benefit from its generality by employing its functional dimension and focusing on its emphasis of hope; this can be done without attempting to manipulate the client to adopt a particular theological or religious stance. Everyone has faith in something, though not everyone has faith in someone. The point is to capitalize on that faith and use it as a reference point to guide the client toward transformation and self-actualization. Certainly, for the Christian client, that faith centers on God. But for those who are not Christian, or who subscribe to another religion or to no

religion at all, an approach is needed that begins with where people are and is spoken to them in language and symbolism that is appropriate to their situation.

The approach to the faith journey that the pastoral counselor employs must always be an approach that the client can relate to and feels comfortable with, since it is his/her faith, journey, and therapy. This therapeutic journey is first and foremost a journey in faith and not toward faith. The pastoral counselor is seen as a facilitator who assists the client on a faith journey of self-actualization, instead of a fixer of problems, as so many therapists are seen to be.

An Integration of Spirituality in Client-centered Therapy

It is this journey in faith that seems to correspond the most succinctly to Carl Rogers' concept of life as "a flowing, changing process in which nothing is fixed."²⁹ Like the journey, life is ever a process and never a product. The essence of the journey is not the destination, but the journey itself. Rogers believes the client is a trustworthy organism who is capable of discovering, selecting, and implementing behavior suitable for any given

²⁹ Carl Rogers, "This is Me, 1961," in The Carl Rogers Reader, eds. Howard Kirschenbaum and Valerie Land Henderson (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1989), 28.

situation.³⁰ One of the goals of non-directive, client-centered therapy is to assist the client in trusting his/her innate impulses, feelings, and thoughts to be valid and reliable means in self-governing.³¹ The ultimate goal of client-centered therapy is self-actualization and societal integration.

The imagery, or metaphor, of the journey illustrates movement and implies direction. Similar to client-centered therapy, with the goal of self-actualization and societal integration, spirituality stresses direction in achieving essentially the same purpose, where the self transcends the individual experience and apprehends ultimate reality through utilizing the resources of faith to function in the context of a lived reality. It is an intuitive and affective attunement to the inner core of human existence that seeks expression in concrete experience. It is much more than merely operating on feelings or instinct. Unlike the popular philosophy of the age, "If it feels good, do it," both spirituality and client-centered therapy underscore the importance of balancing decisions and actions with self-actualization. Emotions and logic are considered in formulating decisions in the recesses of one's inner being and in supporting behavior that is appropriate for the

³⁰ Carl R. Rogers, On Becoming a Person (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1961), 118.

³¹ Carl Rogers, On Becoming a Person, 119.

situation and in harmony with the demand for self-actualization.

Most major decisions are subjective and emotional. For instance in Western society, the person we fall in love with is not necessarily the most logical person to marry. Nor is the car we like the best logical choice or the house we buy the most logical decision. These major decisions are based upon feeling not logic, or feeling mixed with logic. Even the interpretation of empirical data is susceptible to subjectivity, though not intentionally. Emotions and, to some degree, logic determine our moods. If an individual does not feel good and there is no apparent logical reason not to feel good, such as illness or trauma, then one's feelings dictates one's response, unless of course, the person's logic overrides the emotion of not feeling good and restricts it to a attitude instead of a corresponding behavior.

The point that Rogers makes concerning the organism's ability to be deemed trustworthy has tremendous implications for the emotive model of decision-making, especially in light of the fact that the organism is a self-regulatory apparatus which consistently receives data and stimuli and processes it for the edification of the organism. This process is done without the conscious mind entering into the process, yet the effects of the organism's multiple operations can often be felt via the emotions. An example

of this is an illness where the individual is unaware of exposure to a germ or virus, but experiences ill effects prior to the diagnosis. The trustworthiness of the person's body has already informed the person that something is out of kilter and needs attention. There is no apparent reason to feel ill because the person is not logically aware of the fact that he/she has been exposed to a germ or virus. Meanwhile, the emotions will continue to signal the individual that something is physically wrong and demand attention until the problem is resolved because the organism is interrelated.

Both client-centered therapy and spiritual direction seek to allow the organism to express itself constructively, believing in the essential goodness of the organism to self-actualize and integrate into society. While client-centered therapy provides the opportunity to actualize through the therapeutic relationship between the client and the counselor, spiritual direction tends to focus on the development of the spiritual nature through individual and communal activities. These activities are actions that the client employs to develop one's spiritual nature. Since humans are wholistic beings, what affects one dimension has impact on the other dimensions. Spirituality is not an end in itself. It has a positive impact on the development of the whole person and assists in the actualizing of the entire organism by instituting values conducive to growth

and maturation. The crucial elements of client-centered therapy are also inherent in spirituality: unconditional positive regard, empathy, congruence, openness to experience, locus of evaluation, and awareness. All of these are indicative of the indispensable components of spirituality, and thus afford spirituality an opportunity to be integrated naturally in client-centered therapy.

Insights of Spirituality from Jungian Psychoanalysis

At this juncture Jung's psychoanalysis will be considered again to ascertain insights that would be beneficial to the pastoral counselor as a practitioner of spirituality. In light of our discussion of Jungian psychoanalysis in Chapter 3 and the idea of the God archetype in the collective unconscious, one could conclude that practices of spirituality are important in psychotherapy to encourage an experience of God and wholeness. That is not to say that psychotherapy and the practice of spirituality are the only ways to experience God or to experience wholeness. However, supposing that God is an archetype in the collective unconscious, Jung may have identified an important point for treating emotional and physical dysfunctions. God as an archetype requires recognition and expression so a person can actualize.

The process of individuation is comparable with self-actualization (using client-centered and cognitive therapy terminology). To summarize:

This process of inner growth toward wholeness Jung calls "individuation," the process of differentiation, "having for its goal the development of the individual personality." Individuation is a process of separating one's conscious self from the unconscious images that lead to blind illusions. The task is unending, but it is absolutely necessary for the fulfillment of the individual and the betterment of the world.³²

Jung calls this process of separation the "transcendent function" and says it is synonymous with "progressive development toward a new attitude."³³

The significance of Jung's contribution to the utilization of spirituality in pastoral counseling and contemporary psychotherapy is the presupposition that God is a universal archetype in the collective unconscious psyche of everyone; it seeks expression, acknowledgement, and fulfillment through archetypal images. If the God archetype is in the collective unconscious and manifested through archetypal images, and if Jung is correct, or even close at approximating this concept, the implications for practicing spirituality as a therapeutic tool to effectuate the process of self-actualization and wholeness are elementary. Spiritual practices would then become the key to open the lock of one's being and potential. Wholistic development would be the natural process which ensues. The ego would

³² Swanee Hunt, "The Anthropology of Carl Jung: Implications for Pastoral Care," in Jung and Christianity in Dialogue, eds. Robert L. Moore and Daniel J. Meckel (Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist, 1990), 239.

³³ See Hunt, 239-40.

emerge somewhat tarnished from the collective unconscious, but very much in touch with the reality of the archetypal image of God. And the spiritual core, which is centered in the self, would be allowed to flourish when stimulated by spiritual practices.

A Synergistic Paradigm for Pastoral Counseling

"Practice" is whatever people do, and thinking is as much a practice as is ritual or daily routine. If one wishes to understand how the Christian tradition has been practiced rather than to understand only the ideas associated with Christianity, one must reconstruct the interweaving of ideas and activities that have characterized the practice of Christianity in the past.

Margaret R. Miles, Practicing Christianity: Critical Perspectives for an Embodied Spirituality

The practice of Christianity is synonymous with the practice of spirituality, as is the practice of any religious or belief system synonymous with the practice of spirituality. This being understood, a synergistic paradigm for pastoral counseling will be constructed which will encompass some of the practices of certain belief systems into a workable model for pastoral counseling.

Since the majority of pastoral counselors are Christian ministers, it seems only natural to survey some of the more prevalent Christian spiritual practices which would complement the synergistic alliance of pastoral counseling and contemporary psychotherapy. Miles illustrates the relationship between several ascetic spiritual practices and

the "cultivation of the religious self":

Practices both prepare the conditions under which religious experiences are likely to occur and, subsequent to such experiences, provide a lifestyle that integrates and perpetuates them. Hours spent in solitary prayer and meditation, tearful repentance, deprivation of food and sleep, routine physical work, exposure to cold, self-denying service to others--any combination of these and other practices was considered crucial to the cultivation of a religious self.³⁴

As is evident, the various spiritual practices tend to free the psyche from extraneous materials and prepare the mind for receptivity. The practicality of these spiritual disciplines for the therapeutic endeavor is a matter of application. Some of these activities could be assigned to the client as homework, since they would be more conducive in the home environment.

Eastern spiritual practices may be instrumental in facilitating the implementation of spirituality into pastoral counseling. The practices of the Zen Buddhist idea of meditation, the Hindu concept of the spiritual guide assisting in "the ultimate awakening of the human spirit,"³⁵ and the practices of various yogas could be adopted to develop the inner self and actualize the individual.

For the secular individual, the same goal can be achieved by employing similar methodologies. An altered

³⁴ Miles, 91.

³⁵ C. Murray Rogers, "On the Pilgrim Path," in Spirituality in Interfaith Dialogue, eds. Tosh Arai and Wesley Ariarajah (Geneva: WCC Publications, 1989), 17.

state of consciousness can be initiated in a number of ways to achieve the same psychic receptive condition. Charles Tart, a psychologist who specializes in altered states of consciousness, believes that altered states of consciousness are necessary to attain the enlightenment phase which is instrumental in transcending the self and self-actualization. Speaking from a mystical perspective, he alleges that there are essentially five categories which can induce altered states of consciousness:

1. Reduction of external stimulation, such as seen in sleep, boredom, and hypnosis;
2. Increased external stimulation, as exhibited in sporting events, ecstatic states, and excitable gatherings;
3. Increased mental involvement, which could be seen in intense listening, absorption in a mental task, and listening to one's breathing;
4. Decreased alertness, characterized by daydreaming, listening to music, and meditation; and
5. Presence of somatopsychological factors, demonstrated in fasting, sleep deprivation, and dehydration.³⁶

These particular elements could easily be utilized in the

³⁶ Charles Tart, Altered States of Consciousness (New York: Anchor Books, 1969), cited by Ann R. Schreier in "Mysticism and Planetary Salvation," paper presented in partial fulfillment for the course "Theology of Christian Spirituality," School of Theology at Claremont, 19 November 1991.

pastoral counseling setting. Some would, out of necessity, be implemented at home, while others could be employed in the clinical setting.

The client-centered therapeutic model is the most conducive psychotherapy to provide the basic structure for the synergistic paradigm because it is more synonymous with spirituality as a journey in faith than cognitive therapy, even though much spiritual direction is closely akin to cognitive therapy. Client-centered therapy would be the skeletal structure, or foundation, that would be the essential model utilized in pastoral counseling because of its compatibility with the nature of spirituality. However, cognitive therapy and Jungian psychoanalysis would become the other integral elements of the model.

The synergistic paradigm would be viewed as a triangle where spirituality would be at the center, client-centered therapy would be at the base of the triangle providing the foundation, cognitive therapy would be at the left plane, and Jungian psychoanalysis would be located at the right plane. The triangular structure would not be equilateral. In fact, the base would be twice the length of the upright sides to illustrate the comparative value of the disproportional parts or the base of the triangle could be thickened instead of lengthened to illustrate its solid foundation. Hence, client-centered therapy provides the basic foundation of the synergistic paradigm. Cognitive

therapy and Jungian psychoanalysis are seen as applicable and informative parts that supplement this synergistic paradigm for pastoral counseling.

God's Spirit is the matrix within which the whole triangle exists. Spirituality is that dimension of a person that is receptive to the influence of God's Spirit but does not maintain sole jurisdiction over God's Spirit. The entire model is influenced by God's Spirit and subject to the direction of God's Spirit.

CHAPTER 5

A Pastoral Counseling Paradigm for the Navy Chaplain

The test of any meaningful theory is whether the theory works in actual practice. Thus far, I believe this project has taken on a logical format. This project has constructed a theological foundation that is sensitive to and deals realistically with actual problems, while attempting to develop the spiritual dimension that motivates us to reach our potential through the process of self-actualization and transcendence. My assumption has been that the spiritual dimension requires recognition and nurturing for self-actualization and transcendence to transpire. Therefore, the relational/spiritual self structure was addressed and developed and the integration of spirituality with three psychotherapies was postulated. Now it is time to test the premise of this project by applying these principles to interfaith spiritual practices and by formulating an applicable pastoral counseling paradigm for the Navy chaplain.

Integrating Interfaith Spiritual Practices
into a Synergistic Paradigm

This section of the concluding chapter concentrates on the integration of various compatible spiritual practices from indigenous religious traditions and five historic, global religions: Hinduism, Buddhism, Chinese traditions of Confucianism and Taoism, Judaism, and Islam. These are

integrated with previously delineated concepts from Rogerian client-centered therapy, cognitive therapy, and Jungian psychoanalysis. A brief description of each of the major faith traditions will be discussed. Compatible spiritual practice(s) and discipline(s) will be depicted in a summary fashion. Full development is not possible due to the scope of this project and the complexity of the faiths delineated. Then psychotherapeutic principles from the three psychotherapies will be delineated and shown to be compatible with the various interfaith traditions in the format of a synergistic paradigm for pastoral counseling.

Indigenous Religious Traditions

Typically, indigenous religious traditions encompass American Indians, Africans, Australians, and Eskimos, who have shamanism in common.¹ Shamanism, however, is not all there is. Some indigenous religions reject shamanism, and some include much more than shamanism. Shamanism embraces the belief that shamans, "predominant religious figure(s)," have the ability to influence the spirit world and are efficacious in their activity.² This particular belief has two practical and positive dimensions. Survival is the fundamental aspect. The tribe is blessed in such activities as hunting, gathering crops, and fertility. And secondly,

¹ John Carmody, "The Concept of Faith in Comparative Religions," in Handbook of Faith, ed. James Michael Lee (Birmingham: Religious Education Press, 1990), 25.

² Carmody, 25.

members of the tribe are assured a peaceful afterlife, illnesses are cured, and a meaningful existence is guaranteed.³ Though each ethnic and tribal shaman has his/her own unique particularities, they all have in common the mediatorial function of assisting the tribe in warding off evil and promoting good. Ecstasy and transcendence seems to be the primary means in accomplishing this task.

This appears to be a somewhat archaic notion from an enlightened perspective. However, the role of the shaman is similar to the role of the pastoral counselor. Like the pastoral counselor, the shaman functions as a mediator between the spirit world and human existence. The shaman epitomizes divine authority and power by calling upon the spirits either to bless the tribe or to curse the enemy. Shamans also elicit certain coping skills and engender hope in meeting the vicissitudes of human existence. The manner in which the shaman operates is characteristic of the pastoral counselor. They both represent and model divine mysteries. Though the shaman is considered primitive by modern standards, the functions of the shaman are not that different from the modern pastoral counselor. They both facilitate healing, sustaining, guiding, reconciliation, and nurturing--five fundamental and necessary functions of pastoral care and counseling depicted in history as

³ Carmody, 25.

presented by Clebsch and Jaekle.⁴

Hinduism

Hinduism is another religion distinct from Christianity, but it too has certain spiritual similarities conducive to pastoral care and counseling. Hinduism uses the authority of Vedic scriptures. The notion of dharma is the key concept in Hindu faith. Dharma has two primary meanings. First, it means teaching or instruction and is granted authenticity along with the Jewish Torah, Christian scriptures, and Islamic Sharia.⁵ Secondly, dharma refers to the responsibilities of one's inherited place in the caste system of Indian society. Certain responsibilities are inherent in each of the five castes, and the goal of the lowest caste is to advance spiritually to the highest caste. The basic encouragement to people is that "by fulfilling the responsibilities of their caste they could improve their karma and advance toward moksha. Moksha is a state of freedom from all of the constraints"⁶ Karma, "the influence of one's prior deeds, including those performed in previous existences,"⁷ holds one in samsara, the circle of

⁴ William A. Clebsch and Charles R. Jaekle, eds., Pastoral Care in Historical Perspective: An Essay with Exhibits (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1964).

⁵ Carmody, 28.

⁶ Carmody, 29.

⁷ Carmody, 29.

birth and death until moksha is achieved.⁸ Because birth and death are viewed as being painful, moksha is considered a logical and pleasant alternative to samara. Since personal desire binds a person to samara, the key to attaining moksha is detachment from personal desire through the process of enlightenment.⁹

Unlike the shaman's ecstatic function, the Hindu religious figure of the yogin does not attempt to travel to divinities but seeks withdrawal within to gain mastery over "bodily movements, to quiet the senses, to still the imagination, to pass below the level of rational thought, and finally to rest at the bottom of pure consciousness" ¹⁰ through meditation. This ultimate state is known as samadhi and it is considered to be the merging of the ground of reality with the essence of self.¹¹ Meditation is complemented by the purification of one's actions and works. This, in turn, is expressed through "devotional love (bhakti)."¹² This devotional love is rewarded by protection from gods and goddesses, assistance in practical matters, and advancement toward moksha.¹³

⁸ Carmody, 29.

⁹ Carmody, 29.

¹⁰ Carmody, 30.

¹¹ Carmody, 30.

¹² Carmody, 30.

¹³ Carmody, 30.

Because the Hindu religion is very complex, I will not attempt to describe it fully. My intention is to focus upon some compatible spiritual practices, such as meditation, which is common to both Hinduism and Christianity. Meditation not only enlightens the intellect, but it also fosters withdrawal from bodily sensations and promotes detachment from physical surroundings. Meditation affords the practitioner the opportunity to transcend physical boundaries and enter a realm of existence that is both tranquil and spiritual. This concept is especially compatible with a view of Christianity that assumes that the physical and material world is sinful or restrictive, and it is associated with a search for ultimate freedom through the liberation of the spirit.

Buddhism

Buddhism developed as a result of Gautama's (536-476 B.C.E.) desire to resolve the Hindu dilemma of overcoming samaric suffering.¹⁴ Gautama (the Buddha) offered a spirituality of "moderate asceticism and determined meditation (yoga)"¹⁵ This is expressed in the Four Noble Truths: "1) all life is suffering, 2) the cause of suffering is desire, 3) stopping desire will stop suffering, and 4) one can stop desire by following the noble eight-fold

¹⁴ Carmody, 31.

¹⁵ Carmody, 32.

path"¹⁶ These include "right views, right intentions, right speech, right actions, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right concentration."¹⁷

Nirvana is the Buddhist equivalent of the Hindu moksha. Buddhists view the human dilemma as ignorance and see enlightenment as the solution to the problem. Though Buddha was a historical person, Buddha is also personified in the ontological truth of "enlightenment that gives all of reality its meaning."¹⁸ Three differences that distinguish Buddhism from Hinduism are "the repudiation of Vedic religion as authoritative, the Buddhist dismissal of the Hindu gods, and the Buddhist denial that the human personality is a substantial self."¹⁹ Buddhists also practice three virtues: meditation, wisdom, and morality.²⁰ Buddhism teaches "people how to make suffering--pain, despair--lessen," and eventually cease.²¹

In reflecting on the contributions of Buddhism to Christianity, John B. Cobb, Jr. says it well:

Christians can learn from Buddhism without ceasing to be Christians Christianity can convert the apparent contradictions into complementary

¹⁶ Carmody, 32.

¹⁷ Carmody, 32.

¹⁸ Carmody, 32.

¹⁹ Carmody, 32.

²⁰ Carmody, 33.

²¹ Carmody, 35.

contrasts. In all their differences, the truth of Buddhism and the truth of Christianity can live together.²²

Pastoral counselors, especially Christian pastoral counselors, can glean valuable insights from the truths and practices of Buddhism.

One of the primary functions of the pastoral counselor is to reduce human suffering and assist clients in equipping them with coping skills that alleviate the negative consequences of the various tragedies that befall them. Since Buddhism seeks to equip Buddhists with a mind-set that is open to change and focuses upon positive values, it appears that certain selected spiritual disciplines are compatible with Christian values and are beneficial in implementing them into therapy. The noble eight-fold path is certainly characteristic of Christian virtues and worthy of emulation. In fact, the noble eight-fold path epitomizes cognitive therapy in promulgating positive and healthy perspectives.

Confucianism and Taoism

The Chinese religious traditions of Confucianism and Taoism address the issue of harmony with nature. Both speak of the Way and possess a conviction "that reality comprised a living whole which invited human beings to live in order

²² John B. Cobb, Jr., Beyond Dialogue: Toward a Mutual Transformation of Christianity and Buddhism (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1982), 97.

with it."²³ Unlike the animal and plant worlds, humans have to choose to order their lives in harmony with the designated order.²⁴ While Confucianism places emphasis on "the social benefits" of learning and freedom of choice, Taoism stresses the "naturalistic and meditational aspects."²⁵ Regardless of their differences, these two Chinese religious traditions have "intuited that disharmony with the living cosmic whole is the root of social and personal disorders."²⁶

Confucius (551-479 B.C.E.) believed that the orderly Tao, "the Way the universe ran," could be lived out in a peaceful and prosperous society by those doing the right thing, having proper motives, promoting actions for the common good, avoiding violence, and performing religious and social rites.²⁷ These motives, attitudes, and actions are consistent with Christianity in general and pastoral counseling in particular.

In distinction to Confucianism, Taoism stresses wuwei, "active inaction, controlled not-doing."²⁸ Taoists believe in returning to simple living. When this is done, vitality

²³ Carmody, 37.

²⁴ Carmody, 37.

²⁵ Carmody, 37.

²⁶ Carmody, 37.

²⁷ Carmody, 35.

²⁸ Carmody, 37.

will be restored. As human beings live in harmony with the earth and attune to the Tao, then they will mature to "nature's promise."²⁹

The spiritual discipline of being attune to the Tao is very much in keeping with some interpretations of the Christian concept of care for creation. Taking care of God's gracious gifts is respect for both the gift and the giver. Since many view God as a God of order and harmony, God desires His/Her children to live in harmony with natural and moral laws. When we do so, we take the path of least resistance and live more gratifying lives. Order promotes stability and engenders a sense of security.

Stability and security are key concepts in pastoral counseling. Since order in the universe promotes stability and security, order and harmony with natural and moral laws would also promote stability and security in a person's life. The pastoral counselor seeks to develop these by reducing chaos and attuning the client with these laws.

Judaism

Judaism focuses its faith upon faithfulness to God and God's will. "The doctrinal content of Jewish faith has never been so important as behavioral prescriptions."³⁰ The doctrinal substance of the Judaism is derived from diverse interpretations of the Torah. In its narrowest

²⁹ Carmody, 37.

³⁰ Carmody, 42.

understanding, the Torah consists of the first five books of the Hebrew Bible. These books are attributed to Moses. In its broadest sense, the Torah includes all of the Hebrew Bible, plus the rabbinic collections of the Mishnah and the Talmud. The major and minor prophets stress God's call to Israel and her covenant response of obedience to God. This election is predicated upon the initiative of God and provides the basis for a reciprocal relationship between God and Israel throughout history. The primary issue in Judaism is Israel's obedience to the will of God expressed in the law. Behavioral prescriptions tend to take precedent over the knowledge of God.³¹

As time progressed, the rabbinic writings grew in importance and assisted adherents in the interpretation of the Hebrew Bible. Various schools of thought developed which promoted different emphases. Followers devoted themselves to these different schools of thought, and eventually advocates of these schools became quite varied and nuanced. The core, however, "was trying to live by God's Word, trying to do God's expressed will, and so to be holy like the One Lord of hosts."³²

From the period of the Enlightenment, Judaism has struggled to accommodate itself to modernity. Reformed Jews, in contrast to Conservative and Orthodox Jews, have

³¹ Carmody, 42.

³² Carmody, 41.

stressed the rational reinterpretation of the Torah, laying emphasis upon a "rational morality."³³ Regardless of the different traditions, Judaism reveres the Torah as the revelation of God and the content of faith for ethical behavior.

From a spiritual perspective, Judaism affords the believer an opportunity to order one's life in harmony with certain ethical imperatives. These imperatives are viewed as indicatives, expressing the will of God, and therefore, providing the incentive to act as imperatives, or commands of obligation. Since I believe human beings are by nature spiritual beings and endowed with freedom of choice, these ethical imperatives provide a certain orderly direction in life that fosters a sense of well-being and harmony with one's self, one's God, and the cosmos.

Pastoral counselors may employ ethical imperatives from the client's religious heritage or interfaith heritages to foster a sense of well-being and harmony. However, these ethical imperatives should provide spiritual direction instead of promoting guilt. If guilt is the primary motivating factor, the pastoral counselor has reverted to manipulation. Spiritual direction is the goal.

Islam

Islam summarizes its faith somewhat succinctly in the "Five Pillars." These pillars are (1) the profession of

³³ Carmody, 42.

faith that claims "there is no God but Allah, and Muhammad is his [sic] prophet," (2) to pray five times each day, (3) to fast during daylight in the month of Ramadan, (4) to give alms, and (5) to make at least one pilgrimage to Mecca during one's lifetime.³⁴

The revelations Muhammad (570-632) received from God are collected as the Qur'an and vary from the Hebrew Bible. However, Abraham and Moses are identified as spokesmen for the Word. Though venerated by many Muslims, Muhammad disclaims any kinship to God other than that of being God's prophet. He advocated conformity to God's will expressed in the Qur'an; the alternative is to "end up in fire."³⁵ For the Muslim, hell is not eternal. Those believers who have sinned through weakness will one day get out of the fire. Original sin is not doctrinal in the Islamic faith. Though human nature is considered weak, it is not deemed inherently sinful. The "Five Pillars" fortify human nature against the temptations of the flesh.

Particular spiritual disciplines inherent in the Islamic faith are important to pastoral counseling, especially the activities of prayer, fasting, and alms giving. The spiritual disciplines of prayer and fasting would assist clients in cultivating the "religious self" and afford the psyche an opportunity to lose "its grip on former

³⁴ Carmody, 42.

³⁵ Carmody, 45.

interpretive frameworks."³⁶ In other words, the spiritual nature would be nurtured while various problems would decrease in influence due to these two ascetic practices. Alms giving would direct the attention away from the client to another individual in need and provide a sense of fulfillment and gratification to the giver.

Implementation of Principles

At this juncture the previously developed synergistic paradigm for pastoral counseling will be reiterated to incorporate the materials presented into a scheme of principles that would be valuable for people from diverse faiths and non-religious people. The paradigm itself is rather concise but laden with meaning and applicable to most counseling situations.

To reiterate the essential structure of the paradigm depicted in Chapter 4, the synergistic paradigm would be viewed as a triangle where spirituality would be at the center. Client-centered therapy would be at the base of the triangle, providing the foundation. Cognitive therapy would be at left plane. And Jungian psychoanalysis would be located at the right plane. The triangular structure would not be equilateral. In fact, the base would be twice the length of the upright sides or thickened to illustrate the basic foundation and comparative value of the disproportional parts. Cognitive therapy and Jungian

³⁶ Miles, 91.

psychoanalysis are seen as applicable and informative parts of the paradigm for pastoral counseling.

This triangular structure of the synergistic paradigm requires some development. Because Rogerian client-centered counseling corresponds closely with the notion of spirituality's being a journey in faith, it tends to be the most compatible psychotherapeutic method to employ. The primary problem with using this method is that it is non-directive and lengthy. Most Navy chaplains, as well as civilian ministers who provide pastoral counseling, do directive and short-term counseling. They neither have the time or training to do non-directive and extended pastoral counseling. If both problem-resolution and the process of self-actualization are to be encouraged, a modification needs to take place.

Modification includes being more directive and lengthening the counseling sessions. The directive approach would facilitate problem-resolution by adapting psychotherapeutic strategies from cognitive therapy and Jungian psychoanalysis. Lengthening the sessions would support the process of self-actualization and transcendence through the implementation of spiritual practices. Though the counseling sessions would conclude once the client resolves the problem(s), the process of self-actualization and transcendence would continue, supported by the ongoing spiritual practices. The pastoral counseling sessions would

focus upon specific problems and the resolution of these problems by using Rogerian client-centered therapy, cognitive therapy, and Jungian psychoanalysis.

The groundwork for promoting the process of self-actualization and transcendence would be laid in the sessions by incorporating spiritual practices into the sessions themselves. But it would not stop there. These spiritual practices would be employed outside the counseling sessions as homework also.

I believe six fundamental principles are inherent in Rogerian client-centered therapy that are foundational and particularly applicable to this synergistic paradigm for pastoral counseling. They are crucial to providing quality and effective pastoral counseling. These six principles are (1) unconditional positive regard, (2) empathy, (3) congruence, (4) openness to experience, (5) locus of evaluation, and (6) awareness.

Providing unconditional positive regard to the client enables the client to experience acceptance and security. Empathy is connection between at least two human beings. It establishes a relationship of concern and care. Congruence is honesty in words and actions. Openness to experience affords the client an opportunity to be congruent with what is taking place internally and externally. When the client views himself/herself as the locus of evaluation, the client establishes and evaluates issues by standards that are

relevant and meaningful to the client. This indicates that the human organism is a trustworthy guide to satisfying behavior. And finally, awareness is being accountable to all available information and experience and including this data in the valuing process. No datum of knowledge or experience will be denied or distorted.³⁷

Jacqueline B. Persons' cognitive therapeutic principle of interdependence, postulated in Chapter 4, is also applicable and compatible with the idea of pastoral counseling as a journey. Changes in moods can produce changes in behavior and, conversely, changes in behavior can produce changes in moods. Since cognitive therapists attempt to correct distorted cognitions by replacing them with positive cognitions, helping the client to restructure the cognitive process in both a rational and experience-based manner can be significantly enhanced by applying various spiritual practices that develop the whole person.

Jungian psychoanalysis is especially appropriate because it not only acknowledges the existence of a God archetype in the collective unconscious but recognizes the therapeutic value of acknowledging a God archetype and developing the spiritual capacity. In my opinion, it is this spiritual dimension that is crucial to the wholistic

³⁷ Carl R. Rogers, "A Theory of Therapy, Personality, and Interpersonal Relationships, As Developed in the Client-centered Framework," in The Carl Rogers Reader, eds. Howard Kirschenbaum and Valerie Land Henderson (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1989), 250-51.

development of our clients. Jung was willing to acknowledge the importance of developing the spiritual capacity. It only seems logical for pastoral counselors to aid the development of spirituality by incorporating spiritual practices compatible with the clients' frame of reference. Though some clients will profess no affiliation to a particular religion, all persons, in my opinion, are spiritual. Chapter 3 addresses the relational/spiritual self-construct as essential to pastoral counseling. Since all human beings are spiritual beings, whether affiliated with a particular religion or not, it is imperative to develop spirituality. To do otherwise would be to do a serious injustice to our clients. The key is that certain spiritual practices can be used by non-religious people to develop their spirituality without forcing them to subscribe to any religious beliefs or institutions.

Various spiritual practices from diverse faith traditions are compatible with a variety of beliefs, sacred and secular. These spiritual practices are therapeutic in effecting the process of self-actualization and transcendence. Meditation, fasting, alms giving, right intentions and actions, and harmony with nature are a few of the spiritual practices gleaned from the religions described. They could even be compatible with non-religious clients. Religious clients would probably be more open to the spiritual practices of prayer, scripture reading, alms

giving, spiritual guides, and increased enlightenment in their journey toward transcendence.

An example of incorporating various spiritual practices into pastoral counseling could be the case of a marine, who is depressed and experiencing separation-anxiety because he is deployed for six months and separated from his family. The pastoral counselor in the counseling session could explore the man's feelings and allow him an opportunity to vent his frustration. An assessment would be made concerning the nature and depth of his depression. If he is clinically depressed, he would be referred to a medical officer for medical attention and possibly hospitalization. If he is mildly depressed, he would be afforded an opportunity to talk out his depression and to look at his options. If the marine comes from a faith tradition that advocates prayer, he could be encouraged to pray. This would afford him an opportunity to release his emotions and to direct his focus away from himself to God--a source of strength and hope. If the marine is non-religious, he could be encouraged to direct his energy into a worthy endeavor, such as alms giving or getting involved in a humanitarian project at a local orphanage.

Regardless of a person's religious or non-religious preference, this synergistic paradigm employs spiritual practices as therapeutic tools to assist in the process of self-actualization and transcendence. Being cognizant of

the problems people encounter and the need people have for assistance in coping with them and moving beyond, this paradigm employs psychotherapeutic principles that seek problem-resolution and foster self-actualization and transcendence through spiritual development. The strength of this paradigm is its flexibility in meeting the diverse religious and non-religious orientations of clients and in dealing effectively with personal problems through proven psychotherapeutic techniques.

Conclusion

As I conclude this project I am reminded of a conversation I had with Marcus Smucker.³⁸ Smucker made a statement that I have pondered ever since. He said a pastoral counselor cannot successfully provide psychotherapy and spiritual direction to the same client at the same time. The statement was made because of the issue of transference. Transference is a key issue in successfully effecting recovery in psychoanalysis, but it is not solicited or even desired in spiritual direction because it misdirects one's attention away from God to the spiritual director. While I concur with the intent of the statement, it has challenged me to look for ways to facilitate spirituality through pastoral counseling.

³⁸ Marcus Smucker, Ph.D., is a Mennonite scholar at the Mennonite Biblical Seminaries in Elkhart, Indiana. During the spring semester of 1992 he was a visiting scholar at the School of Theology at Claremont.

My intention in writing this project has been to incorporate spirituality into psychotherapy in a legitimate manner that recognizes the validity of both distinct disciplines while capitalizing on those compatible elements which are conducive to pastoral counseling in the context of Navy chaplaincy. I concur with Smucker that spiritual direction and psychotherapy are two distinct disciplines which are incompatible in the consolidated union of pastoral counseling . However, spirituality and psychotherapy are, in my opinion, compatible because they deal with two dimensions of human existence--the spiritual and emotional being. These two dimensions require recognition and nurturing. Spiritual practices enhance and develop spirituality. The goal is not spiritual direction per se, but the wholistic development of the self, which encompasses the psychological, spiritual, physical, and social dimensions of selfhood. Neither is psychotherapy a goal in itself. The end is the harmonious development of the whole person integrated into society with as little traumatic damage as possible.

Bibliography

Books

- Arai, Tosh, and Wesley Ariarajah, eds. Spirituality in Interfaith Dialogue. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1989.
- Augsburger, David W. Pastoral Counseling Across Cultures. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1986.
- Barth, Karl. Dogmatics in Outline. Trans. G. T. Thompson. New York: Harper & Row, 1959.
- The Bible. King James Version.
- Browning, Don S. Religious Thought and the Modern Psychologies. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1987.
- Burns, David D. Feeling Good: The New Mood Therapy. New York: Signet, 1981.
- Clebsch, William A., and Charles R. Jaekle, eds. Pastoral Care in Historical Perspective: An Essay with Exhibits. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1964.
- Clinebell, Howard J., Jr. Basic Types of Pastoral Care and Counseling: Resources for the Ministry of Healing and Growth. Rev. ed. Nashville: Abingdon, 1984.
- . Basic Types of Pastoral Counseling: New Resources for Ministering to the Troubled. Nashville: Abingdon, 1966.
- Cobb, John B., Jr. Beyond Dialogue: Toward a Mutual Transformation of Christianity and Buddhism. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1982.
- . Theology and Pastoral Care. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1977.
- Conn, Joann Wolski, ed. Women's Spirituality: Resources for Christian Development. New York: Paulist, 1986.
- Erikson, Erik H. Identity and the Life Cycle. New York: International Univ. Press, 1959.
- Freud, Sigmund. The Future of an Illusion. New York: W. W. Norton, 1961.
- Hanson, Bradley C., ed. Modern Christian Spirituality: Methodological and Historical Essays. Atlanta:

Scholars Press, 1990.

Hunter, Rodney J., ed. Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling. Nashville: Abingdon, 1990.

Jordan, Judith V., Alexandra G. Kaplan, Jean Baker Miller, Irene P. Stiver, and Janet L. Surrey, eds. Women's Growth in Connection: Writings from the Stone Center. New York: Guilford, 1991.

Jung, Carl G. The Archetypes and the Collective Unconscious. Vol 9.1 of The Collected Works of C. G. Jung. 2nd. ed. Trans. R. F. C. Hull. Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1959.

---. Two Essays on Analytical Psychology. Vol. 7 of The Collected Works of C. G. Jung. 2nd. ed. Trans. R. F. C. Hull. Princeton: Princeton Univ. Press, 1966.

---. The Undiscovered Self. New York: Mentor, 1957.

Kirschenbaum, Howard, and Valerie Land Henderson, eds. The Carl Rogers Reader. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1989.

Malony, H. Newton, Michele Papen-Daniels, and Howard Clinebell, eds. Spirit-centered Wholeness: Beyond the Psychology of Self. Lewiston, N.Y.: Edwin Mellen Press, 1988.

Maslow, Abraham. Motivation and Personality. New York: Harper & Bros., 1954.

Miles, Margaret R. Practicing Christianity: Critical Perspectives for an Embodied Spirituality. 1988. Reprint. New York: Crossroad, 1990.

Moltmann, Juergen. Theology of Hope. New York: Harper & Row, 1967.

Moore, Robert L., and Daniel J. Meckel, eds. Jung and Christianity in Dialogue: Faith, Feminism, and Hermeneutics. Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist, 1990.

Pannenberg, Wolfhart. What Is Man? Trans. Duane A. Priebe. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1970.

Paris, Peter J. The Social Teaching of the Black Churches. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1985.

Peerman, Dean G., and Martin E. Marty, eds. A Handbook of Christian Theologians. Nashville: Abingdon, 1965.

- Persons, Jacqueline B. Cognitive Therapy in Practice: A Case Formulation Approach. New York: W. W. Norton, 1989.
- Rizzuto, Ana-Maria. The Birth of the Living God: A Psychoanalytic Study. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1979.
- Rogers, Carl R. On Becoming a Person. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1961.
- Schleiermacher, Friedrich. The Christian Faith. Ed. H. R. Mackintosh. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1928.
- Song, C. S. Tell Us Our Names: Story Theology from an Asian Perspective. Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis, 1984.
- Stone, Howard W., and William M. Clements, eds. Handbook for Basic Types of Pastoral Care and Counseling. Nashville: Abingdon, 1991.
- Winnicott, D. W. The Maturation Processes and the Facilitating Environment: Studies in the Theory of Emotional Development. New York: International Univ. Press, 1965.
- Wolberg, Lewis R. The Practice of Psychotherapy: 506 Questions and Answers. New York: Brunner/Mazel, 1982.

Articles

- Carmody, John. "The Concept of Faith in Comparative Religions." In Handbook of Faith. Ed. James Michael Lee. Birmingham: Religious Education Press, 1990.
- Cousins, Ewert. Preface to the series. In Christian Spirituality: Origins to the Twelfth Century. Eds. Bernard McGinn and John Meyendorff. World Spirituality, vol. 16. New York: Crossroad, 1985.
- Hanson, Bradley C. "Spirituality as Spiritual Theology." In Modern Christian Spirituality: Methodological and Historical Essays. Ed. Bradley C. Hanson. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1990.
- Hunt, Swanee. "The Anthropology of Carl Jung: Implications for Pastoral Care." In Jung and Christianity in Dialogue: Faith, Feminism, and Hermeneutics. Eds. Robert L. Moore and Daniel J. Meckel. Mahwah, N.J.: Paulist, 1990.
- Patton, John. "Pastoral Counseling." In Dictionary of

Pastoral Care and Counseling. Ed. Rodney J. Hunter. Nashville: Abingdon, 1990.

Rogers, C. Murray. "On the Pilgrim Path." In Spirituality in Interfaith Dialogue. Eds. Tosh Arai and Wesley Ariarajah. Geneva: WCC Publications, 1989.

Rogers, Carl R. "The Necessary and Sufficient Conditions of Therapeutic Personality Change." In The Carl Rogers Reader. Eds. Howard Kirschenbaum and Valerie Land Henderson. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1989.

---. "A Theory of Therapy, Personality, and Interpersonal Relationships, As Developed in the Client-centered Framework." In The Carl Rogers Reader. Eds. Howard Kirschenbaum and Valerie Land Henderson. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1989.

---. "This is Me, 1961." In The Carl Rogers Reader. Eds. Howard Kirschenbaum and Valerie Land Henderson. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1989.

Rosen, Irving M. "The Spiritual Dimension of Cognitive Therapy." Journal of Religion and Health 30 (Summer 1991): 94-97.

Schneiders, Sandra M. "Theology and Spirituality: Strangers, Rivals, or Partners?" Horizons 13, no. 2 (1986): 265-67.

Surrey, Janet L. "The Self-in-Relation: A Theory of Women's Development." In Women's Growth in Connection: Writings from the Stone Center. Eds. Judith V. Jordan, Alexandra G. Kaplan, Jean Baker Miller, Irene P. Stiver, and Janet L. Surrey. New York: Guilford, 1991.

Other Sources

Schreier, Ann R. "Mysticism and Planetary Salvation." Paper presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the course "Theology of Christian Spirituality," School of Theology at Claremont, 19 November 1991.

Suchocki, Marjorie. Course lectures. "Theology of Ministry." School of Theology at Claremont, Fall 1991.